

Regional Transportation Plan and Sustainable Communities Strategy Roundtable
Wednesday, April 26, 2017
2:00 PM

RTP Members Present

David Fey, LAFCo
Ken Karsevar, At Large
Robert Morse, Central Unified School District
Marta Frausto, Caltrans
Paul Peschel, Kings River Conservations District
Moses Stites, Fresno County Rural Transportation Agency
Joe Prado, Fresno County Dept of Public Health
Nicholas Don Paladino, Fresno Cycling Club
Mike Prandini, Building Industry Association of Fresno Madera Counties
Mohammad Khorsand, County of Fresno
Rob Terry, City of Reedley
Dwight Kroll, City of Clovis
Jennifer Lukumberry, City of Mendota
Adam Livingston, Southern Sierra Partnership
Amanda Monaco, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability
Mike Ratajski, Quad Knopf, Inc
Tony Molina, Fresno Bicycle Coalition
Scott Mozier, City of Fresno

I. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS - Dave Fey

Called to at 2:01 p.m. by Mr. Fey (Fresno LAFCo), Chair.

II. PUBLIC PRESENTATIONS

No public presentation

III. FOLLOW UP ITEMS

A. Nomination and Election of Vice Chair (David Fey)

Mr. Stites (FCRTA) nominated Joe Prado. A vote was called for and passed.

B. Growth Projection Changes (Seth Scott) [INFORMATION]

Mr. Scott (FCOG) reported that Fresno COG has contracted with Applied Development Economics to create a demographic growth forecast to aid in the 2018 RTP/SCS planning effort. Since the presentation presented to the Roundtable in February, a few minor adjustments have been made to account for updated data. These changes do not affect any growth totals during the planning period of 2015-2050 -- however, there were some very minor adjustments made in the interim years. The updated report and executive summary were included with this item.

In addition, the Department of Finance (DOF) has just recently released their updated population projections, and they are somewhat lower than their previous projections as well as the current forecast. Mr. Scott

explained that the reason for the discrepancy dealt primarily with birth rates, which historically have a corresponding relationship with economic vibrancy: while ADE assumed that birth rates would recover with the economy after the 2008 recession (as supported by historical trends), DOF seems to be assuming that birth rates will stay low indefinitely. It is believed, by staff, that the current forecast is still valid despite the most recent DOF forecast.

Furthermore, Mr. Scott explained that there are no real implications for holding to a forecast that differed from the DOF projections, since this RTP cycle is not being done in conjunction with a housing element update. The next RHNA process will occur in 2022, at which point there will be a completely different set of projections from the DOF.

Mr. Prado (Fresno County Public Health) asked if the population projections will affect the modeling and if 6% is significant. Mr. Scott (FCOG) responded that it is significant. We want to put forth what we want to see but that are accurate.

This item was information only, no further action was required.

C. Important Farmland and Land Consumption Indicators (Kai Han) [ACTION/DISCUSSION]

Mr. Han (FCOG) reported that following last month's Roundtable discussion, COG staff conducted further investigations regarding the two indicators--important farmland and land consumption.

Important farmland indicator is defined as total acres of important farmland (prime, unique and state-wide importance) consumed due to new growth.

Land consumption indicator is defined as acres of land consumed due to new development.

Considering Fresno has the richest agricultural land in the world and the fact that the EIR for the RTP specifically analyzes the impact on important farmland, COG staff recommends using important farmland as one of the top 10 indicators.

The Roundtable had a lengthy discussion about growth within Cities Sphere of Influence.

A motion was made by Mr. Livingston, seconded by Ms. Monaco to approve Important Farmland and Land Consumption into the top indicator list. A vote was called for and motion failed

A motion was made by Mr. Khorsand, seconded by Mr. Prado to approve Important Farmland as one of the top 10 indicators. A vote was called for and motion passed. Members Prandini, Manoco and Livingston voting no.

IV. NEW INFORMATION/DISCUSSION ITEMS

A. Approve March 26, 2017 Meeting Summary

A motion was made by Mr. Khorsand, seconded by Mr. Prado. A vote was called for and motion passed.

B. Update on EJ Subcommittee (Trai Her-Cole) [INFORMATION]

Ms. Her-Cole (FCOG) reported that the Environmental Justice (EJ) Subcommittee's 10 positions were approved by the Policy Board on February 25, 2016. This committee will serve as a subcommittee of Fresno COG's Transportation Technical Committee (TTC) and will meet when Fresno COG staff, the TTC, the Policy Advisory Committee (PAC) or the Fresno COG Policy Board request recommendations on items involving EJ populations.

They will also meet to assist Fresno COG staff in setting thresholds for EJ Populations for the EJ Report within each Regional Transportation Plan (RTP). The subcommittee members would report all advisory actions to the TTC through an EJ Representative. Then the TTC’s recommendations would be referred to the PAC and Fresno COG Policy Board as needed.

The subcommittee will have ten positions to provide full, diverse and equitable representation from designated

Environmental Justice population:

- Local agency urban
- East side local agency rural
- West side local agency rural
- 3 Minority representatives for the following nationalities with the highest population in Fresno County:
 - Hispanic
 - African American
 - Hmong
- 2 Low Income
- Senior (65 or older)
- Persons with disabilities

FCOG has received 8 applications from the following individuals:

Name	Agency	Representing	Email
Amanda Monaco	Leadership Counsel	Minority or Low-Income	amonaco@leadershipcounsel.org
Mariah Thompson	California Rural Legal Assistance	Minority or Low-Income	mthompson@crla.org
Jennifer Lekumberry	City of Mendota	West-side City African American or	jennifer@cityofmendota.com
LeRoy Candler	Public	Senior	papacandler@yahoo.com
Frankie Olivares	City of Selma	East-side City	folivares@cityofselma.com
Esther Posiglione	Cultiva La Salud	Hispanic	ester@cultivalasalud.org
Jill Gormley	City of Fresno	Urban City	Jill.Gormley@fresno.gov
Michael Mendez	Resources for Independence in the Central Valley	Disabled/Senior	mmendez@ricv.org

The TTC and PAC approved the above applications to the subcommittee and authorized FCOG to provide tentative appointments to the EJ Subcommittee if they are deemed eligible with the understanding that final confirmation must be approved by the TTC. The first EJ Subcommittee meeting is tentatively scheduled on Wednesday, May 11th at 10:00am, at the Fresno COG offices, in the Ash Room.

This item was information only, no further action was required.

C. EIR Notice of Preparation and Scoping Meeting (Meg Prince) [INFORMATION]

Ms. Prince (FCOG) reported that Fresno COG issued a Notice of Preparation (NOP) for the Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) for the 2018 RTP/SCS on March 31, 2017. The NOP informs reviewers of the lead agency’s intent to prepare an EIR with a 30-day public comment period, which will end the first week of

May. A scoping meeting was held on **April 26, 2017** beginning at 10:00 AM in the Sequoia Conference Room of Fresno COG's offices. The scoping meeting provided a brief overview of the EIR process, the project and scope of the EIR, and an opportunity to obtain input from agencies and/or the public on the scope of the EIR. The NOP is available for download on Fresno COG's Regional Transportation Plan webpage: <http://www.fresnocog.org/rtp>.

This item was information only, no further action was required.

D. Financial Element - 1st Technical Work Group Meeting (Jennifer Soliz) [INFORMATION]

Ms. Soliz (FCOG) reported that the first meeting of the Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) Financial Element Technical Group for the review of the 2018 RTP Project Evaluation Criteria was held on Thursday, April 6, 2017. Topics of discussion included an overview of the RTP Financial Element, a review of the previous project evaluation criteria, and a draft of the Financial Element timeline. We received feedback which included addressing equity as recognized in the needs assessment, target regional and federal goals, include a broader selection for the definition of an activity center, and include the criteria "project serves a transportation disadvantaged population" to all evaluation criteria (bicycle and pedestrian, streets and roads, and transit projects). We encourage this committee to provide feedback as we continue to update the criteria. Next steps include approval of the evaluation criteria, funding forecasts, developing funding scenarios, and call for projects. Our next technical advisory committee meeting will be held on May 3rd at Fresno COG from 1:30-3:30pm. Members of the Roundtable asked for clarification on what "equity" means with regard to the RTP. It was recommended by the Chair that members speak to the Technical Work Group for clarification.

This item was information only, no further action was required.

E. GHG Target Recommendation (Kristine Cai) [APPROVE]

Ms. Cai (FCOG) reported that Senate Bill 375 (SB 375) requires that greenhouse gas (GHG) emission reduction targets be updated every 8 years. The California Air Resources Board (ARB) adopted the first sets of targets in 2010 for the 18 Metropolitan Planning Organizations (MPOs) in the State, and is in the process of updating the targets. Targets are set for each region at a percent reduction of passenger vehicle GHG emissions per person from 2005 level. The 8 MPOs in the San Joaquin Valley were given the targets of 5% reduction for 2020, and 10% reduction for 2035 in 2010.

SB375 is focused on GHG reduction from passenger vehicles from integrated transportation and land use planning. MPOs are tasked with the implementation of SB375 through the development of a Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS) in their Regional Transportation Plan (RTP). An SCS is a land use development pattern combined with transportation strategies, which if implemented, will meet or exceed the GHG reduction targets set by the ARB.

Due to the declining transportation revenues and the increased vehicle efficiencies, which reduces the cost of driving and thus increases the overall vehicle miles driven (VMT), MPOs are having challenges achieving the existing targets. However, in order to meet the State's aggressive GHG reduction goals, the ARB is looking for more enhanced targets from each region. MPOs across the State sent consistent messages that the State needs to explore more tools such as pricing and other revenue strategies to achieve the state's goal.

Fresno COG achieved 11% per capita GHG reduction in 2035 in the 2014 SCS, and is proposing to aim for 13% per capita reduction by 2035 for the 2017 target update. Based on the modeling that has been conducted, 13% is an ambitious target to the Fresno Region, but can be achieved with the implementation of the latest general plans from the cities/County, and more aggressive investment in vanpool/carpool, active transportation, electric

vehicle (EV) programs and other alternative transportation strategies. The 2035 target scenario consists of land use strategies such as mixed uses and increased density, infill development, growth concentration along the high capacity transit corridors, etc. Transportation strategies include more investment in transit, bike/ped, carpool/vanpool programs and other alternative transportation strategies such as EV charging stations. The latest growth forecast is applied in the target scenario, and the Model Improvement Plan (MIP) 2 model and EMFAC2014 are used in the quantification of the GHG reduction.

The members had a lengthy discussion about achieving a more aggressive and ambitious target. Fresno is the fifth biggest MPO with poor air quality. Ms. Monaco commented that Fresno COG's target should be more in line with what the Big Four MPOs (Bay Area, Southern California, San Diego and Sacramento) are proposing, which is an 18% reduction. Staff responded that what is being proposed is more aggressive than what was achieved in the previous SCS. An alternative would be to go into an Alternative Planning Strategy (APS) which is not financially constrained with projects that are not feasible in our region. The Big Four MPOs have tools that are not available in Fresno (i.e. BART, TOD, more transit options and higher density). Fresno is more rural and the same tools are not always an option for our communities.

A motion was made by Ms. Monaco, seconded by Mr. Livingston to delay the approval for a month to discuss with staff and review Sacramento and Tulare plans. A vote was called (six yes, 11 no) motion failed.

A motion was made by Mr. Terry, seconded by Mr. Khorsand to approve 13% per capita GHG reduction by 2035 as the new target for the Fresno region. A vote was called (11 yes, 5 no, 1 abstain) motion passed.

F. Feedback from Public Workshop (Seth Scott) [DISCUSSION]

Mr. Scott reported that on April 25, 2017, Fresno COG hosted a public workshop at Hoover High School to promote the 2018 Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) and garner public input on the scenario development process. Staff presented the public's response to the four draft scenario concepts, as well as their expressed priorities and values. RTP Roundtable members were encouraged to contact Mr. Scott if they were interested in presenting a scenario concept for consideration at that meeting. As significant interest was shown by members in participating in such an exercise, staff was directed to form a subcommittee to focus on scenario development.

Roundtable members and a member of the public complimented staff of the workshop. Staff reported that enough information has been gathered to model a preferred scenario.

This item was information only, no further action was required.

V. Other Items

A. Items from Staff

1. Meg Prince (FCOG) reported that there is an Affordable Housing and Sustainable Communities workshop May 3, 2017, 1:00-4:00pm at Parc Grove Commons. A handout for the workshop was provided.

B. Items from Members

1. Mr. Prado expressed appreciation for the discussion on GHG target and would like FCOG staff to provide the Roundtable with the types of projects that would increase the target and work toward these goals in the future. Member discussion continued in support of reaching for a more ambitious, but achievable targets in the future.

2. Mr. Ratajski reported that he attended a meeting at Fresno City College. The meeting discussed how the half billion bond measure funding will be spent. The focus of the discussion was on building a parking facility for the FCC.
3. Mr. Khorsand asked what the ARB is doing about residential wood burning in the urban areas.

C. Item from Public

1. Mr. Payne spoke on rural transit and connecting west side cities to education centers in Fresno.
2. Ms. Gale responded to Mr. Khorsand comments about residential wood burning. There is a joint effort between the Valley Air District and State Air Resources Board. They will hold public workshops in the coming weeks to address air quality issues.

Next meeting date: May 24, 2017 from 2:00 – 4:00 PM.

AFTER MEETING: RTP Roundtable Member Spotlight - Moses Stites, General Manager for Fresno County Rural Transit Agency

Members of the Public

Mary Savala, League of Women Voters
Scott Myatt, Fresno State
Eric Payne, Toure Associates
Mariah Thompson, CRLA, Inc.
Mike Leonardo, FCTA
Roger Brown, Citizen
Tanisha Sonell, Citizen
Genevieve Gale, Central Valley Air Quality Coalition

Fresno COG Staff

Kristine Cai
Trai Her-Cole
Seth Scott
Lang Yu
Meg Prince
Jennifer Soliz
Jeff Long
Esperanza Velazco
Brenda Veenendaal
Donna Blocker
Jeaneen Cervantes