

**Policy Advisory Committee
Minutes
Friday, November 3, 2017
10:00 AM**

Members Present

Luke Serpa, City of Clovis
Ben Gallegos, City of Firebaugh
Jeannie Davis, City of Fowler (via phone)
Wilma Quan-Schechter, City of Fresno
James Doughty II, City of Huron
Alexander Henderson, City of Kingsburg
Vince DiMaggio, City of Mendota
Nicole Zieba, City of Reedley
Tim Chapa, City of Sanger
Elizabeth Nunez, City of San Joaquin
David Elias, City of Selma
Bernard Jimenez, County of Fresno
Michael Navarro, Caltrans
Tony Boren, Fresno COG

The meeting was called to order at 10:30 a.m. by Mr. Henderson (Kingsburg), Chair.
With 12 members present, there was a quorum to conduct business.

I. TRANSPORTATION CONSENT ITEMS

- A. Executive Minutes of October 13, 2017 [APPROVE]
- B. 2018 Annual Fresno COG Meeting Calendar [APPROVE]
- C. First Quarterly Work Element and Financial Report (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]
- D. City of Clovis Fiscal Year 2016-17 Transportation Development Act Claim (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]
- E. City of Fowler Fiscal Year 2017-18 Transportation Development Act Claim (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]
- F. Federal Transit Administration Authorizing Resolution (Peggy Arnest) [APPROVE]
- G. Transit Asset Management Target Setting (Muyi Zhou) [APPROVE]
- H. Update on the Fresno Transformative Climate Communities (TCC) Program (Meg Prince) [INFORMATION]
- I. Transit and Intercity Rail Capital Program and State Rail Assistance – Final Program Guidelines and Call for Projects (Meg Prince) [INFORMATION]
- J. Infill Infrastructure Grant Notice of Funding Availability (Trai Her-Cole) [INFORMATION]
- K. Affordable Housing Sustainable Communities (AHSC) Technical Assistance Memorandum of Understanding (Meg Prince) [APPROVE]
- L. On-call Contract with TJKM (Kristine Cai) [APPROVE]
- M. Draft Action Element Update (Jennifer Soliz) [INFORMATION]

After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Elias (Selma) motioned and Mr. Serpa (Clovis) seconded to approve the consent agenda as presented. The motion passed.

II. TRANSPORTATION ACTION/DISCUSSION ITEMS

Items were taken out of order from original agenda. Items heard as follows II-D-1, II-D-2, II-C, II-A and II-B.

D. Regional Transportation Plan Progress (Kristine Cai)

1. Sustainable Communities Strategy Fall 2017 Outreach and Responses (Brenda Veenendaal) [INFORMATION]

Ms. Veenendaal (FCOG) reported that Fresno COG released four Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS) scenarios on October 5, 2017 for public review and preferred scenario selection. Fresno COG staff's outreach strategy is running from September 20 to November 9 using a three-pronged approach. It includes 14 scenario presentations given at existing group or organization meetings, 20 booths at community events throughout Fresno County and an online, interactive survey easily accessible via smart phone or computer. Outreach events and presentations were held in 11 communities, but survey responses were received from residents throughout the county.

The survey outreach was designed to provide the TTC, PAC and Policy Board tools for understanding what Fresno County residents believe is important when planning for future growth. By October 26, 2017, 1,134 completed scenario preference surveys had been collected, with six events left on the outreach schedule. A summary of all responses received prior to the November TTC/PAC meetings will be tallied, handed out and reported by staff at the meeting. All comments regarding the scenarios are also being compiled and will be available prior to the meeting on the www.YourVision2042.com website.

In addition, staff is looking for additional opportunities to advertise the online, interactive survey -- available in English and Spanish -- through November 9 at www.YourVision2042.com. Fresno COG staff requests a link be added to local agency and partnering websites directing interested residents to the interactive surveys. Any other promotional opportunities are welcomed as well.

The outreach calendar and materials were provided. All outreach materials are available in English and Spanish. They included:

- RTP/SCS Fact Sheets in English and Spanish
- Posters of each scenario - English only attached
- Scenario selection cards - our vehicle used to collect demographic data and participant preferences
- Scenario indicator performance details - English attached
- Presentation PowerPoint - English attached

This item is informational only, no further action was required.

2. Preferred Scenario Selection (Seth Scott) [APPROVE]

Mr. Scott reported Fresno COG staff is undergoing its third round of public outreach for the 2018 Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) and Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS), with a focus on educating the public about the four scenarios produced, along with the analysis and modeling results for each. Participants are encouraged to share which of the four scenarios best aligns with their priorities and vision for Fresno County, as well as to provide feedback concerning any negative impacts, if any, they foresee for their community resulting from those scenarios not selected.

Below is a summary of the four scenarios. All four meet the Air Resource Board's greenhouse gas (GHG) reduction target for the Fresno County region (-13 percent per capita GHG reduction by 2035 compared to 2005).

SCENARIO A:

- **Meets** the recommended GHG reduction target (13 percent)
- Highest investment in road maintenance and active transportation; lower investment in expanded roadway capacity; all transit projects funded
- Assumes **balanced** Countywide growth
- **Moderately aggressive** land-use strategies (lowest residential density and multi-family development) - identical to Scenario D
- **Significant improvement** in farmland conservation (58 percent less farmland consumed than 2014 RTP)

SCENARIO B:

- **Exceeds** the recommended GHG reduction target (14 percent)

- Highest investment in road maintenance and active transportation; lower investment in expanded roadway capacity; all transit projects funded
- Assumes **more growth in Fresno-Clovis Metro Area** (5 percent increase by 2035)
- **Most aggressive** land-use strategies (highest projections for residential density, multi-family, and mixed-use development)
- **Vast improvement** in farmland conservation (88 percent less farmland consumed than 2014 RTP)

SCENARIO C:

- **Meets** the recommended GHG reduction target (13 percent)
- Highest investment in road maintenance and active transportation; lower investment in expanded roadway capacity; all transit projects funded
- Assumes **more growth in small incorporated cities and unincorporated rural communities** (21 percent increase by 2035)
- **More aggressive** mixed-use and multi-family strategies
- **Improvement** in farmland conservation (24 percent less farmland consumed than 2014 RTP)

SCENARIO D:

- **Meets** the recommended GHG reduction target (13 percent)
- High investment in road maintenance; moderate investment in expanded roadway capacity and active transportation; all transit projects funded
- Assumes **balanced** Countywide growth
- **Moderately aggressive** land-use strategies (lowest residential density and multi-family development) - identical to Scenario A
- **Significant improvement** in farmland conservation (58 percent less farmland consumed than 2014 RTP)

Of the 811 public surveys tallied as of October 26, 33 percent selected **Scenario B** as the preferred option. **Scenario A** was close behind at 29 percent. This information will be updated as additional results are available.

Staff and the RTP Roundtable recommended **Scenario D** as the 2018 SCS's preferred scenario. Fresno COG staff requests a preferred scenario recommendation from TTC as well.

Mr. Henderson (Kingsburg) asked about the TTC's discussion/debate prior to the recommendation. Mr. Scott responded that there was support for Scenario D from most of the member agencies. The City of Fresno and Mary Savala voted no against recommending Scenario D and voiced support for Scenario B. It was argued that if Scenario B performs best, is supported by the public and the City of Fresno is showing support by way of future policies, then Scenario B is the clear choice. There was also discussion about what role public participation should play in this level of the decision-making process. Concerns were expressed that all the public outreach events should have been completed before asking the advisory bodies to make a recommendation.

Ms. Quan-Schechter (Fresno City) expressed the City of Fresno's support for Scenario B because it aligns with public interest and motioned to approve Scenario B. Mr. Henderson stated he would finish member and public comment before taking a vote on the motion.

Amanda Monaco (LCJA) stated that Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability supports Scenario C because it invests more funding in rural areas. Public participation and environmental justice (EJ) obligations should be taken into account when making a decision. The public outreach should be completed before recommendations are made. With regard to EJ obligations, Fresno COG is tasked with selecting the best alternative for investing in EJ communities. It is the hope that this body will look at not just the indicators, but also the *location of the prioritized projects and what would best serve the EJ communities*.

Sarah Sharp (Central CA Asthma Coalition) expressed support for Scenario B & A because the reduction in criteria pollutants is important for the health of our communities.

Genevieve Gale (CVAQ) expressed support for Scenario B because it has the highest number of avoided deaths, largest GHG reduction, least consumption of important farmland and has the highest public approval rating based on the outreach survey results. Scenario A would be a follow-up choice.

Mr. Stites (FCRTA/TTC Member) stated that as the only rural public transit provider in Fresno County, there is a need for well-maintained roads to provide safe and reliable transit services to the rural disadvantaged communities. FCRTA supports Scenario D.

Mary Savala (League of Women Voters/TTC Member) stated that there is significance of the results of the public surveys and although it is one tool to consider when making a decision, it should be giving weight. None of the survey results gave preference to scenario D. The League of Women Voters supports Scenario B.

Mohammad Khorsand (Fresno County/TTC Member) expanded on the earlier discussion about the debate during the TTC meeting. With regard to the public participation, the public survey results represented less than 1 percent of the population of Fresno County. TTC's support for Scenario D was based on the high investment in road maintenance, moderate investment in roadway capacity, relieving delays and congestion, reducing GHG and making roads safer for vehicles and bicyclists.

Mr. Jimenez (Fresno County) stated that Fresno County is concerned with Scenario B in terms of it anticipating future growth in metropolitan areas outside of the general plan process. Scenario D is respectful of the cities' current general plans and represents member agencies' current efforts.

Mr. DiMaggio (Mendota) stated that there is a tendency to support Scenario D, but there are nuances between Scenario B & D. With Scenario B, the land use assumptions in rural areas are unrealistic. The most realistic assumptions that can be obtained would be Scenario D.

After opportunity for public comment, Ms. Quan-Schechter (Fresno City) motioned to approve Scenario B as the preferred scenario for the 2018 RTP/SCS. No member offered a second and the motion failed. Mr. Jimenez (Fresno County) motioned and Mr. Elias (Selma) seconded to approve Scenario D as the preferred scenario for the 2018 RTP/SCS. Member Quan-Schechter voted no. The motion passed.

City of Clovis exits. 11 members present there was a quorum to conduct business.

C. Measure C Expenditure Plan Program Update Fiscal Year 2017-18 (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]

Mr. Beshears (FCOG) reported the cost estimates for the Measure C Regional Transportation Program increased \$1.6 million from the prior plan. Revenues increased \$4.5 million, reducing the total overall deficit in the 20-year plan to \$267.7 million.

The urban program has estimated revenues of \$730.2 million and projected expenses of \$763.7 million, for a net deficit of \$33.5 million. Net project costs decreased \$5.4 million.

Approximately \$4.1 million in increased funding is provided for three projects in fiscal year (FY) 2017-18: Willow – Shepherd to Copper; Herndon – Temperance to DeWolf and; Shaw – DeWolf to McCall. Staff anticipates the Willow project will be the initial candidate for the new Senate Bill 1 (SB1) Local Partnership Program. In addition, a \$2 million contingency has been restored to the State Route (SR) 41, SR 180 and SR 168 braided ramps projects until the final cost is available. The SR 180 West Landscaping project, scheduled in FY 2021-22, increased \$923,000.

Veterans Boulevard is anticipated to increase \$6.9 million from the previous plan. The project is expected to be ready to list in FY 2018-19. The urban plan provides two options for delivering Veterans Boulevard. The City of Fresno is applying for a \$44.5 million federal Infrastructure for Rebuilding America (INFRA) grant. If the INFRA grant application is successful, the City intends to start construction in FY 2018-19, as required by the INFRA grant; however, if the grant is not successful, Measure C's Expenditure Plan provides an alternative to deliver the project in FY 2019-20 using State Transportation Improvement Program (STIP), Measure C and Regional Transportation Mitigation Fee (RTMF) funds. Delivering Veterans Boulevard in FY 2019-20 includes a tentative plan for the City to borrow \$13.4 million of its Measure C local allocation.

SR 99 – North to Cedar is anticipated to cost \$86 million, including 15 percent for environmental and design cost. About \$3 million in STIP APDE funding is programmed in FY 2018-19 to start the environmental process. Caltrans anticipates environmental work will be complete by October 1, 2021. Another \$43.4 million is programmed to start design and right-of-way in FY 2021-22. Finally, \$50.7 million for construction is scheduled in FY 2023-24.

The rural program has \$491.5 million in estimated revenues and \$725.7 million in planned expenses for a net deficit of \$234.2 million. Net project costs have increased \$6.98 million.

Following requests from local jurisdictions and the County, Mark Thomas Engineering has updated its 30 percent design specifications for Golden State Avenue and revised various scopes. The revised specifications call for enhanced pavement requirements per geotechnical testing; a realignment for Stroud, including a traffic signal and rail road requirements; moving a traffic signal from DeWolf to McCall; replacing a deteriorated bridge and culvert on the Fowler Switch Canal; various lighting and; extending the project limits from Lincoln Avenue back to American Avenue. The scope changes add \$5.5 million to the project, which is on schedule to begin construction in FY 2018-19. The plan carries 10 percent for construction engineering and a 20 percent contingency, which may be spread around to project components or reduced as design nears completion.

The next major project for the rural plan is the SR 99/American Avenue interchange, one of five half-interchanges that allow traffic to get on the freeway going one direction and off from the other direction. The others are located at North, Cedar, Central and Chestnut. Together, they provide complete access to a growing industrial area and the proposed High Speed Rail Heavy Maintenance facility. Because Caltrans no longer uses the half-interchange structure, the network of access points will have to be adjusted, reducing the number to three complete interchanges. For this reason, economies of scale will be realized by environmentally clearing all three interchanges at the same time.

Approximately \$350,000 is programmed in FY 2017-18 for a Project Study Report (PSR) for American Avenue, which, due to the proximity to North/Cedar, will likely include an analysis of the entire SR 99 corridor between the two interchanges and \$3.3 million in FY 2018-19 for environmental work. This coincides with the \$3 million APDE funding programmed for North/Cedar. Once environmental work is complete, Caltrans will better determine how construction should be phased; however, the plan joins the schedule for American with North\Cedar, programming \$7.2 million in design and right-of-way for American in FY 2021-22 and \$49.3 million in FY 2023-24 for construction. These estimates are based on very preliminary numbers that were devised in 2004 for the ballot. Actual costs will be better known once the PSR is complete.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Chavez (Sanger) motioned and Mr. Jimenez (Fresno County) seconded to approve the 2017-18 update to the Measure C Regional Transportation Program. The motion passed.

City of Sanger exits. 10 members present. There is a quorum to conduct business.

A. Golden State Boulevard Project/Mark Thomas Contract Amendment (Peggy Arnest) [APPROVE]

Ms. Arnest (FCOG) reported that in April 2016, FCOG's Board entered into a \$3.7 million contract with Mark Thomas and Co. for design engineering the Golden State Boulevard project. The project is increasing in scope by approximately 10 percent. Consequently, Mark Thomas and Co. is asking for an increase of \$428,864 in its engineering design budget. The additional tasks mainly address the scope increase but also include a hydraulic analysis of the Fowler Switch Canal, geotechnical engineering for a pedestrian bridge over the canal and a traffic index for the Pavement Analysis.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Elias (Selma) motioned and Mr. Jimenez (Fresno County) seconded to approve an increase of \$428,864 to the Mark Thomas and Company contract for design engineering of tasks that were not included in the original scope of the Golden State Boulevard contract.

B. Regional Transportation Improvement Program (RTIP) Submittal Resolution 2017-38 (Jennifer Soliz) [APPROVE]

Ms. Soliz (FOCG) reported that at the September meeting, the Policy Board approved Fresno COG's Regional Improvement Program component to the 2018 State Transportation Improvement Program (STIP) allocation plan priorities:

1. Veterans Boulevard as the highest priority 2018 STIP project.
2. Designate State Route (SR) 99 North/Cedar Interchange as the second priority for 2018 STIP, project approval & environmental documentation (PA&ED) and plans, specifications and estimates (PS&E) programming.
3. Right-of-way (ROW) for SR 41 Elkhorn to Kings County line.

During the 2016 STIP, Fresno COG programmed SR 180 West Freeway Landscaping. This project was delayed during the 2016 STIP due to funding constraints but is required mitigation for the SR 180 West from SR 99 to Hughes West. Caltrans will need to update the PS&E when the project closer to construction, increasing support costs \$245,000. Construction

expenses will also increase by \$678,000, for a total increase of \$923,000. Staff recommends keeping existing programming of \$4.7 million in 2020/21 for SR 180 West Freeway Landscaping project.

For fiscal year (FY) 2019-20, the Veterans Boulevard project is recommended for \$14.6 million in construction from STIP County shares. The region has invested \$34.4 million in local funds to get this project ready to list and the City of Fresno has applied for a \$44.1 million Federal Infrastructure for Rebuilding America (INFRA) grant. If the INFRA grant is not successful, the region proposes the \$116.7 million construction phase be paid with a combination of STIP, Measure C, development impact fees and local contributions from the City of Fresno.

Meanwhile, \$2 million is recommended for right-of-way (ROW) on the SR 41 Elkhorn to Kings County line project. Caltrans has proposed reprogramming \$8 million in the Interregional Transportation Improvement Program (ITIP) towards this project for PS&E and ROW to complete the six-mile gap remaining on SR 41 between Kings and Fresno counties. Caltrans has agreed to propose that the project's \$52.4 million construction phase receive future ITIP funds and has requested the region contribute another \$4 million in STIP county shares when the construction funding is requested in FY 2024-25.

This brings the total programming against the FY 2019-20 target to \$16.6 million, in accordance with the California Transportation Commission's recommended minimum target.

The regional target for Planning, Programming and Monitoring (PPM), \$1.197 million, will be programmed in \$399,000 increments in FY 2020-21, 2021-22 and 2022-23.

A new funding category -- Advanced Project Development Element (APDE) -- has been created to encourage shelf-ready projects. The APDE target applies against the county share balance, but not against the region's FY 2019-20 target. Fresno COG recommends programming \$3 million for environmental clearance and PA&ED on the SR 99 North/Cedar Interchange project. This project is on the Measure C Tier I list. Once the environmental document is complete, design, ROW and construction will be programmed with a combination of STIP and Measure C funds. Caltrans expects this project to be ready for construction in FY 2023-24.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Elias (Selma) motioned and Mr. Jimenez (Fresno County) seconded to adopting Resolution 2017-38 to submit Fresno COG's 2018 RTIP to the California Transportation Commission. The motion passed.

III. ADMINISTRATIVE CONSENT ITEMS

There are no Administrative Consent Items.

City of Fresno exits. There are 9 members present. There is a quorum to conduct business.

IV. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION/DISCUSSION ITEM

A. Fiscal Year 2017-18 Overall Work Program Amendment No. 2 (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]

Mr. Beshears reported:

Work Element 117 – The Measure C 2017 update includes an increased work scope for the Golden State Project, adding \$428,864 to the design contract with Mark Thomas.

Work Element 123 - Last year the Policy Board authorized a \$370,000 Federal Transit Administration 5304 grant-funded, Long-Range Transportation Plan that began late in the year, with only \$26,173 expended. Caltrans requires Fresno COG to adjust the budget to reflect the remaining balance.

Work Element 124 - Last year the Policy Board authorized a \$363,725 Federal Transit Administration 5304-funded Business Commute Option study performed by Fresno State and UC Denver that began in the year, with only \$914 expended. Caltrans requires Fresno COG to adjust the budget to reflect the remaining balance.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Elias (Selma) motioned and Ms. Jimenez (Fresno County) seconded to authorize fiscal year 2017-18 Overall Work Program and Budget Amendment No. 2 for \$401,777. The motion passed.

B. 2018 Fresno Council of Governments Legislative Platform (Trai Her-Cole) [INFORMATION/DISCUSSION]

Mr. Phipps reported that the legislative platform includes Fresno COG's policy priorities in state and federal legislative matters. It represents a unified voice when communicating legislative priorities to state and federal lawmakers as well as to relevant state and federal agencies. It also provides guidance to Fresno COG staff and agency partners when advocating on behalf of the Policy Board. The 2017 Legislative Platform approved in February is attached. Staff is requesting comments to assist in updating the 2018 legislative platform. Staff encourages and welcomes Board input to develop the Fresno COG 2018 legislative platform.

This item is informational only, no further action was required.

C. One Voice Update (Robert Phipps) [INFORMATION]

Mr. Phipps reported that Fresno COG will host its 2018 One Voice D.C. trip April 22-26, 2018. Staff is issuing its annual call for regional priorities, focusing on a strong transportation nexus or component, as well as its call for sponsorships.

Please submit any proposed regional priorities using the attached white paper template, including all information needed to educate federal elected officials, administration staff and other decision makers regarding your priority's requests and significance to the region, as well as any maps, photos or other visuals available. All proposed recommendations must be submitted electronically to Trai Her-Cole at traih@fresnocog.org by 5 p.m. Thursday, January 5, 2018.

For those resubmitting a previous year's priority, please provide an updated white paper for review and consideration. Staff encourages new regional priorities as well. The One Voice Steering Committee will review and select the 2018 priorities and recommend a regional priority listing for March 2018 approval by the Fresno COG Policy Board.

Any agency submitting more than one regional issue for consideration should identify them in priority order. Please follow the format in the attached template for all new and existing regional priority requests. The template includes a sample priority for reference. The Microsoft Word template will be provided electronically upon request.

In addition, a copy of Fresno COG's 2018 One Voice sponsorship letter is attached, including three potential levels for support. Member jurisdictions and other interested parties are asked to broadcast both the call for projects and sponsors to other agencies, organizations and businesses that have expressed an interest in regional transportation-related affairs. Sponsorship requests or questions may be directed by email to Robert Phipps at rhipps@fresnocog.org.

This item is informational only, no further action was required.

V. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Items from Staff

- Mr. Boren (FCOG) reported that the Amtrak morning express to Sacramento was supposed to kick off on January 8, 2018, but it has been pushed back six months due to track maintenance.
- Mr. Boren (FCOG) reported that there will be no December meeting.

B. Items from Members

There were no items from members.

VI. PUBLIC PRESENTATIONS

A. Public Presentations –

There were no public presentations.

Adjourned at 11:40 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Tony Boren

Public

Mohammad Khorsand, Fresno County
Kevin Smith, Mark Thomas
Jim Grant, Diocese of Fresno
Tony Molina, Fresno County Bicycle Coalition
Sarah Sharpe, Central CA Asthma Collaborative
Victoria Santillan, CRLA
Amanda Monaco, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability
Michael Osborn, P&P/City of Mendota
Genevieve Gale, Central Valley Air Quality Coalition
Mike Leonardo, FCTA

Staff

Brenda Veenendaal
Robert Phipps
Les Beshears
Kristine Cai
Peggy Arnest
Seth Scott
Trai Her-Cole
Meg Prince
Jennifer Soliz
Jeaneen Cervantes