

**Fresno COG Policy Board  
MINUTES  
Thursday, July 26, 2018  
5:30 PM**

**Members Attending:**

Mayor Bob Whalen, City of Clovis  
Councilmember Ron Lander, City of Coalinga  
Mayor Felipe Perez, City of Firebaugh  
Mayor David Cardenas, City of Fowler  
Councilmember Clint Olivier, City of Fresno  
Mayor Rey León, City of Huron  
Mayor Rhonda Armstrong, City of Kerman  
Mayor Michelle Roman, City of Kingsburg  
Councilmember Robert Silva, City of Mendota  
Mayor Victor Lopez, City of Orange Cove  
Councilmember Robert Beck, City of Reedley  
Mayor Pro Tem Amarpreet Dhaliwal, City of San Joaquin  
Mayor Pro Tem Eli Ontiveros, City of Sanger  
Mayor Pro Tem Scott Robertson, City of Selma  
Supervisor Sal Quintero, County of Fresno

Gail Miller, Caltrans  
Kyle Roberson, Legal Counsel  
Tony Boren, Executive Director

**Absent:**

Mayor Lee Brand, City of Fresno  
Mayor Alma Beltran, City of Parlier

**Quorum:** At the start of the meeting, there were 14 members representing 45.57% of the population. There was a quorum to conduct business. (Clovis, Coalinga, Firebaugh, Fowler, Huron, Kerman, Kingsburg, Mendota, Orange Cove, Reedley, San Joaquin, Sanger, Selma and Fresno County).

The meeting was called to order at 5:32 p.m. by Mayor Pro Tem Dhaliwal (San Joaquin), Chair.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**Fresno County Rural Transit Agency meeting will follow the Policy Board meeting**

**Pledge of Allegiance**

**Sitting as the Mayors City Selection Committee (Includes the County)**

**I. Measure C Citizen Oversight Committee Appointments (Brenda Veenendaal/Robert Phipps) [APPOINT]**

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Lopez (Orange Cove) motioned and Mayor Pro Tem Robertson (Selma) seconded to appoint Bob Allen to the Measure C Citizen Oversight Committee to serve a new four-year term beginning July 1, 2018.

## II. TRANSPORTATION CONSENT ITEMS

- A. Executive Minutes of June 28, 2018 [APPROVE]
- B. 2018-19 Measure C Claims (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]
- C. Resolution 2018-22 Transportation Development Act 2018-19 Final Apportionment (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]
- D. Resolution 2018-23 State Transit Assistance Apportionment 2018-19 (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]
- E. City of Reedley 2018-19 Transportation Development Act Claim (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]
- F. Sustainable Infrastructure Planning Grant Program Cycle 1 Contract Award (Jennifer Soliz) [APPROVE]
- G. Fiscal Year (FY) 2018 Bus and Bus Facilities Infrastructure Investment Grant Program NOFA (Trai Her) [INFORMATION]
- H. End of Federal Fiscal Year E-76 and Federal Transit Administration Transfer Deadlines and Obligational Authority Updates (Jennifer Soliz) [INFORMATION]
- I. Fresno County Airport Land Use Compatibility Plan Public Hearing and Comment Period (Brenda Veenendaal) [INFORMATION]
- J. Affordable Housing and Sustainable Communities Program Round 4 (Meg Prince) [INFORMATION]

After an opportunity for public comment, Councilmember Beck (Reedley) motioned and Mayor Lopez (Orange Cove) seconded to approve the consent agenda as presented. The motion passed.

## III. TRANSPORTATION ACTION/DISCUSSION ITEMS

### A. Golden State Project/Mark Thomas Contract Amendment (Peggy Arnest) [APPROVE]

Ms. Arnest (FCOG) reported that the original Golden State Boulevard Project design called for shifting Golden State over to 8<sup>th</sup> Street in Fowler's main business district, from approximately Adams Avenue to South Avenue – 1.5 miles. During a series of public meetings in Fowler during April and May, several public comments expressed concern about this shift. Many businesses on 8<sup>th</sup> Street were adamantly against this original design. At its June 5 meeting, the Fowler City Council voted to remove the shift and keep Golden State on its current alignment. Because of this change, construction costs will decrease by close to \$4 million. Fresno COG staff recommends holding these funds in the City of Fowler's contingency to be used for the improvements the California Public Utilities Commission and Union-Pacific Railroad are requesting. In addition, the contract with design engineering consultant Mark Thomas will need to increase by approximately \$200,000 to cover the redesign engineering costs. The Mark Thomas extra work request is attached to this item.

Mayor Pro Tem Robertson (Selma) asked if the redesign would delay the project. Ms. Arnest responded that it will not. Councilmember Silva (Mendota) asked to hear from Mayor Cardenas. Mayor Cardenas (Fowler) concurred and reiterated what was reported by Ms. Arnest. Mayor Whalen (Clovis) asked what the logic behind the original idea for realignment was. Ms. Arnest responded that a study done in 2007 designed to assist the City of Fowler with economic development. It was found that the realignment would negatively affect current businesses as opposed to future businesses.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Cardenas (Fowler) motioned and Mayor Pro Tem Robertson (Selma) seconded to approve the \$197,128 increase to the Mark Thomas and Company contract for redesign engineering of the Golden State Blvd alignment from South to Bonita Avenue. The motion passed.

### B. Measure C Taxi Scrip Pilot Program Agreement with GoGoGrandparent (Donna Blocker) [APPROVE]

Ms. Blocker (FCOG) reported that for the last three years, Fresno COG staff has researched options to move the Measure C Senior Taxi Scrip Program from paper scrip to a digital currency while also incorporating transportation network companies such as Uber and Lyft. GoGoGrandparent provides a phone service that connects older adults without smartphones to Uber or Lyft rides. By calling a central hotline number, users can request and pay for rides without using a ride app or needing a smart phone. GoGoGrandparent has been in business for three years with service everywhere there are Lyft and or Uber drivers. (A company brochure is attached.) In a recent comparison of trip prices, staff found that Uber and Lyft's prices are one-half to one-third of the cost of current taxicab fares in Fresno, providing an additional incentive to coordinate services for senior participants.

After monitoring GoGoGrandparent's services and progress, staff approached the company regarding a partnership opportunity with the Measure C Senior Taxi Scrip program. GoGoGrandparent agreed to allow Taxi Scrip participants to use their monthly scrip value to access rides with Uber and Lyft using the GoGoGrandparent service, 24 hours a day, seven days a week. In an effort to assess the viability of this partnership, COG staff is asking for approval to launch a GoGoGrandparent/Senior Scrip pilot program beginning September 1, 2018 and concluding March 1, 2018. The pilot program would include up to 80 Taxi Scrip seniors, providing them \$50 of scrip per month to utilize the service and report their experiences back to Fresno COG staff. The total cost for this pilot program would not exceed \$26,500.

Mayor Whalen (Clovis) asked if the scrip will be transferable. Ms. Blocker responded that the scrip amount would be loaded onto the senior's account. Mayor Pro tem Robertson (Selma) asked how the program will be marketed. Ms. Blocker responded that outreach will be done to educate the senior's. Mayor Pro Tem Dhaliwal (San Joaquin) asked how many users are currently enrolled in the taxi scrip program. Ms. Blocker responded that there are approximately 5000 users, about half consistently buy and use scrip. Mayor Pro Tem Ontiveros (Sanger) suggested that a mechanism should be put in place for the user or user's family member to be able to electronically check account balances.

After an opportunity for public comment, Councilmember Silva (Mendota) motioned and Mayor Lopez (Orange Cove) seconded to authorize the Executive Director to enter into an agreement with GoGoGrandparent to conduct a six-month pilot program beginning September 1, 2018 and not to exceed \$26,500. The motion passed.

### **C. 2018 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy (Kristine Cai) [APPROVE]**

Ms. Cai (FCOG) reported that Fresno COG is required to update its Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy (RTP/SCS) every four years. The 2018 RTP/SCS development process began in fall 2016. An RTP Roundtable Committee comprising representatives from local governments, Caltrans, transit operators, the Air District and other sectors such as water, education, farming, social justice, cycling, building industry, environment/air quality, etc. was formed to help guide the process. Staff developed a robust and extensive outreach program to engage the public that included 15 community workshops, 20 informational booths at community events and 11 presentations to organizations to determine a preference of SCS scenarios. All outreach information was made available online and in both English and Spanish.

In November 2017, after careful consideration of the public's input and recommendations from the Roundtable and the TTC/PAC, the Fresno COG Policy Board selected Scenario D as the preferred SCS scenario. Scenario D is:

- An ambitious sustainability plan with significant advancements over the status quo (i.e. the projected growth pattern before the 2014 SCS)
- A growth plan that acknowledges current planning assumptions and local land use authority
- On track to meet the San Joaquin Valley Blueprint's goals
- Meets SB 375 requirements
- A realistic and feasible growth scenario that allows the Fresno County region to grow at its own pace and retain its own character

Fresno COG released the draft RTP/SCS, draft EIR, draft FTIP document and the draft corresponding Air Quality Conformity Analysis for public comment on April 5, 2018. A revised conformity analysis was recirculated for 30 days on May 18. All the final documents are available on Fresno COG's website.

- The 2019 FTIP is a near-term listing of capital improvement and operational expenditures using federal and state monies for transportation projects in Fresno County during the next four years (<https://www.fresnocog.org/project/federal-transportation-improvement-program-ftip/>).
- The 2018 RTP/SCS is a long-term, coordinated transportation/land use strategy to meet Fresno County transportation needs to 2042 (<https://www.fresnocog.org/project/regional-transportation-plan-rtp/>).
- The EIR document provides an analysis of potential environmental impacts related to the 2018 RTP/SCS' implementation, as required by the California Environmental Quality Act (<https://www.fresnocog.org/project/regionaltransportation-plan-rtp/>).

- The conformity analysis contains the documentation to support a finding that the 2019 FTIP and 2018 RTP/SCS meet the air quality conformity requirements for ozone and particulate matter (<https://www.fresnocog.org/project/regionaltransportation-plan-rtp/>). Staff received eight comment letters during the 55-day public review period. The responses are included in the final documents.

Ms. Martinez (FCOG) presented to the Policy Board with regard to the FTIP. Ms. Prince (FCOG) presented to the Policy Board with regard to the draft EIR.

**Staff requests that action be taken separately on each item listed below:**

**1) FTIP:** The FTIP is a four-year program that includes a listing of transportation projects requiring federal funding and approval by federal transportation agencies. Projects included in the FTIP are consistent with Fresno COG's Regional Transportation Plan and are part of the area's overall strategy for providing mobility, congestion relief and reduction of transportation-related air pollution and greenhouse gas emission in support of efforts to attain federal air quality standards and to meet the State's climate change requirement. One comment was received from Caltrans about the 2019 FTIP, and responses are included in the final document.

Mayor Whalen (Clovis) asked if it is uncommon to have a large number of significant unavoidable impacts. Georgiena Vivian (VRPA) responded that the environmental document is looking at the region not any one particular project, but a group of projects. Fresno COG does not have land use authority. There is no way to ensure that the environmental impacts associated with these projects will be mitigated by the local agencies once the local agency starts to implement the project. Significant impacts had to be identified because Fresno COG does not have authority as to what the local agencies and Caltrans will do as they start to move forward with projects. Each project will have to be assessed as to what environmental impacts it may cause and the local agency is responsible to prepare an EIR. This particular EIR is specific to the RTP.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Lopez (Orange Cove) motioned and Councilmember Lander (Coalinga) seconded to approve the 2019 Federal Transportation Improvement Program. The motion passed.

**2) The Air Quality Conformity Analysis:** A transportation conformity analysis is required by section 176(c) of the Clean Air Act, as amended in 1990, in non-attainment areas to ensure that transportation plans, programs and projects will not produce new air quality violations, worsen existing violations or delay timely attainment of the national ambient air quality standards. No comments were received about the conformity analysis for the 2018 RTP and the 2019 FTIP during the public comment period.

After an opportunity for public comment, Councilmember Beck (Reedley) motioned and Mayor Pro Tem Dhaliwal (San Joaquin) seconded to approve the conformity analysis for the 2018 Regional Transportation Plan and the 2019 Federal Transportation Improvement Program. The motion passed.

**3) EIR:** Fresno COG prepared a Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) for the 2018 RTP/SCS project assessing environmental effects related to the development of the 2018 RTP/SCS.

The 2018 RTP/SCS identifies the region's transportation needs and issues, sets forth an action plan of projects and programs to address the needs consistent with the adopted policies and documents the financial resources needed to implement the plan. Projects are identified at a conceptual level for purposes of the RTP, and the program EIR is programmatic in nature – meaning it does not specifically analyze individual projects. The PEIR finds that the implementation of the 2018 RTP/SCS could result in potentially significant and unavoidable direct and cumulative environmental impacts in the following areas: aesthetics, agricultural & forestry resources, air quality, biotic resources, climate change/greenhouse gases, cultural resources & tribal cultural resources, energy and energy conservation, geology/soils/minerals, hazardous materials, hydrology & water resources, land use and planning, noise, population, housing and employment, public utilities, other utilities and services, and transportation/traffic. Included in the final PEIR are responses to comments received on the draft PEIR document, changes made/addressed within the document in response to those comments, findings of potential impacts and a statement of overriding considerations, and a mitigation monitoring program to address such findings.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Whalen (Clovis) motioned and Councilmember Lander (Coalinga) seconded to certify the Program Environmental Impact Report for the 2018 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy to the Policy Board by the adoption of resolution 2018-25. The motion passed.

**4) RTP/SCS:** The 2018 RTP/SCS identifies the region's transportation needs and issues, sets forth an action plan of projects and programs to address the needs consistent with the adopted policies, and documents the financial resources needed to implement the plan. Fresno COG has included all the required elements in the plan, has engaged in extensive public outreach, prepared the required Program Environmental Impact Report and completed the associated Federal Transportation Improvement Program and Air Quality Conformity documents. Responses to the comments about the Draft RTP/SCC are included in the document.

Ashley Warner, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability addressed the Policy Board on two points. Public input should receive explicit consideration and benefits to low income communities and communities of color are not unreasonably delayed. Ms. Cai responded that the Leadership Counsel was involved in the entire process and project evaluation.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Pro Tem Ontiveros (Sanger) motioned and Mayor Roman (Kerman) seconded to approve of the 2018 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy to the Policy Board by the adoption of Resolution 2018-26 as attached, which also includes the aforementioned FTIP and Air Quality Conformity Analysis. The motion passed.

#### **D. Caltrans Report (CALTRANS) [INFORMATION]**

Ms. Miller (Caltrans) reported:

- State Route (SR) 99 realignment to accommodate High Speed Rail between Clinton and Ashlan Avenue. The temporary southbound Shields Avenue off ramp was closed permanently after the southbound off ramp to Clinton Avenue was reopened. The Southbound off ramp to Clinton and Golden State is now open. The pavement correction on southbound SR 99 from Clinton to Olive Avenue is complete with the rubberized asphalt overlay. Utilizing the new alignment northbound and southbound. The northbound onramp to Golden State is scheduled to have a 30 day closure beginning mid-August while the ramp is reconstructed. The new northbound ramp from Clinton is scheduled to reopen in mid-August. The contractor poured the Ashlan Avenue overhead bridge deck. The new Ashlan overhead bridge is complete. The critical path to project completion is now focused on the north end of the project to construct Golden State realignment under the overhead structure.
- Kings Canyon Expressway 3; structure work continues and the project is on schedule.
- State Route 41 auxiliary lanes from M Street to the Tulare overcrossing. The project continues to progress. The contractor continues to work on miscellaneous drainage, fence, and electrical items. Once the work is done the road will be restriped and open to the new alignment. Completion is anticipated for mid-August.
- San Joaquin River Bridge seismic retrofit. All substructure work has been completed. Traffic has been switched and work is progressing on the northbound deck. The last working day will be April 2, 2019.
- State Route 269 Bridge. Anticipated start of construction is November 2018.

Mayor Whalen (Clovis) addressed the braided ramp 168 to 41 dead stops as far back as Shields Avenue. Ms. Miller responded that she will get Mayor Whalen in contact with John Lu. Mayor Cardenas (Fowler) addressed the graffiti on the sound wall between Divisadero and Van Ness. Ms. Miller responded that she will get a maintenance crew out to get it cleaned up.

This item is informational only, no further action was required.

#### **IV. ADMINISTRATIVE CONSENT ITEMS**

- A. Regional Clearinghouse (Jennifer Soliz) [APPROVE]
- B. Assembly Bill 2734 (Frazier) California Transportation Commission- Letter of Support (Trai Her-Cole) [APPROVE]

After an opportunity for public comment, Councilmember Silva (Mendota) motioned and Mayor Leon (Huron) seconded to approve the consent agenda as presented. The motion passed.

## **V. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION/DICUSSION ITEMS**

### **A. 2017-18 Audit Contract (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]**

Fresno COG's contract with its auditing firm is set to expire. The County Auditor/Controller has recommended that staff bid out the contract for a five-year term. An RFP was sent out to a list the Auditor/Controller provided on June 11, 2018. Proposals were due July 5.

The engagement will include audits for FCOG, FCRTA, member agency Transportation Development Act, Measure C street funds, and the Regional Transportation Mitigation Fee Agency. The RFP also included provisions for a separate contract with the Fresno County Transportation Authority to perform the Measure C Local Transportation Fund member agency audits. This is consistent with FCOG's and the Authority's policy of combining the Transportation Development Act member agency audits so jurisdictions don't have the inconvenience of two audit firms at the same time.

The current contracts are for 751 hours at an annual cost of \$90,120.

The committee is reviewing two proposals: Price Page & Company, a Clovis Accounting firm, has conducted audits for planning agencies similar to FCOG, such as Merced County Association of Governments and Madera County Transportation Commission. The firm has also audited cities in Fresno, Madera and Kings Counties. Its bid estimated 790 hours for \$110,600 during the first two years, \$113,918 for the third and fourth year and \$117,336 for the fifth, for a total of \$566,372.

Hudson, Henderson, & Co. Inc., a Fresno Accounting firm, has audited planning agencies similar to FCOG, such as Kings County Association of Governments. It has also conducted audits for various cities, counties, special districts, and school districts. The firm's bid estimated 1,725 hours for \$149,405 during the first three years and \$156,790 for the next two, for a total of \$761,795.

Staff solicited various member agencies to form a selection committee, including the County Auditor/Controller's Office, Fresno Area Express, Fresno County Rural Transit Agency, the City of Coalinga, and the Fresno County Transportation Authority. The selection committee reviewed the proposals and unanimously recommended Price Page & Company.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Lopez (Orange Cove) motioned and Mayor Leon (Huron) seconded to award the audit contract for 2017-18 – 2021-22 to Price Page & Company for \$566,372. Mayor Pro Tem Dhaliwal (San Joaquin) abstains. The motion passed.

## **VI. ELECTION OF CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR**

Current:

Mayor Amarpreet Dhaliwal (San Joaquin) Chair

Mayor David Cardenas (Fowler) Vice Chair

Mayor Lopez (Orange Cove) nominated Mayor Pro Tem Dhaliwal (San Joaquin) as Chair and Mayor Cardenas (Fowler) as Vice Chair.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Lopez (Orange Cove) motioned and Mayor Armstrong (Kerman) seconded to approve the election of Chair and Vice Chair to serve March 2017-March 2018. A vote was called and the motion passed.

## VII. OTHER ITEMS

### A. Items from Staff

- Mr. Boren reported that there will be no meeting in August
- Mr. Boren introduced Santosh Bhattarai to the Policy Board.

### B. Items from Members

- Councilmember Silva (Mendota) thanked the Policy Board for the nomination to the RDA oversight Board.
- Mayor Lopez (Orange Cove) partial funding was received for temperance flat from the Water Board.

## VIII. PUBLIC PRESENTATIONS

Renova Home Improvements Inc. (Sal Cuevas/Jose Marron) presented to the policy Board.

Adjourn to FCRTA at 7:23 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Tony Boren

### Public

Sal Cuevas, Renova  
Jose Marron, Renova  
Nicolas Paladino, Fresno Cycling Club  
James Polfer, Mark Thomas  
Joe Rye, FCRTA  
Ashley Warner, Leadership Counsel  
Isaac Moreno, City of Selma  
Art Wille, County Counsel  
Charity, Best Best (via phone)

### Staff

Les Beshears  
Robert Phipps  
Kristine Cai  
Brenda Veenendaal (via phone)  
Peggy Arnest  
Trai Her-Cole  
Meg Prince  
Seth Scott  
Jennifer Soliz  
Suzanne Martinez  
Moses Stites  
Janelle Del Campo  
Jeff Long  
Todd Sobrado  
Santosh Bhattarai  
Donna Blocker  
Esperanza Velazco  
Jeaneen Cervantes