

www.fresnocog.org

FRESNO COUNTY AIRPORT LAND USE COMMISSION Action Summary

Date: Monday, April 8, 2019

Time: 2:00 p.m.

Place: COG Sequoia Conference Room

2035 Tulare St., Suite 201, Fresno, CA

1. CALL TO ORDER

A meeting of the Fresno County Airport Land Use Commission (ALUC) was called to order by Chairman Duarte at 2:06 p.m. and also led the flag salute.

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Commissioners: Ron Duarte, Ray Remy, Daniel Yrigollen, Bill Darnell, Bob Beck

Proxies: Steve Rapada, Dwight Kroll

ABSENT: Commissioners: Sal Quintero, Nathan Magsig

Proxies: Dan Card, Mark Davis

OTHERS ATTENDING:

Brenda Veenendaal, Fresno COG Staff
Stephanie Maxwell, Fresno COG Staff
Lindsay Beavers, Fresno County Counsel
Mark Duran, Outfront Media
Trenton Suntrapak, Outfront Media

Arynn Ramage, Outfront Media
Jarred Olsen, City of Fresno
Kathy Eide, Outfront Media
Kevin Meikles, FAT

2. Action/Discussion Items

A. Minutes of the March 4. 2019 ALUC

A motion was made by Commissioner Remy and seconded by Commissioner Yrigollen to approve the March 4, 2019 Fresno County Airport Land Use Commission minutes. A vote was called for and the motion carried with one abstention.

B. <u>Development Permit Application No. P18-02898, City of Fresno on behalf of OUTFRONT Media (Staff: Brenda Veenendaal)</u>

Brenda Veenendaal reported on this item. This item was considered by the ALUC at the March 4, 2019 meeting. The Commission tabled the item with a request for more information regarding effects the billboard's lighting system may have on the safety of airplane approach and departures. Specifically, the Commission chair requested examples of other airports that have approved projects such as this in close proximity to safety zones.

<u>Project description</u>: Development Permit Application No. P18-02898 proposes the construction of a 65-foot high digital LED back-to-back billboard. The billboard dimensions will be 14-feet high by 48-feet wide. It would sit at the northwest edge of Zone 3: Inner Turning Zone of Fresno Air Terminal, adjacent to the Inner Approach/Departure Zone. Within this zone ALUC review is required for any proposed object taller than 35 feet AGL. Federal Aviation Administration review may be necessary for proposed objects adjacent to the runway edges.

New land uses that may cause visual, electronic, or increased bird strike hazards to aircraft in flight shall not be permitted within any airport's influence area. Specific characteristics of land use proposals to be evaluated include:

- (a) Glare or distracting lights which could be mistaken for airport lights;
- (b) Sources of dust, steam, or smoke which may impair pilot visibility;
- (c) Sources of electrical interference with aircraft communications or navigation;

The criteria for limiting the height of structures, trees, and other objects in the vicinity of an airport shall be based upon 14 CFR Part 77, Subpart C, and applicable airport design standards published by the Federal Aviation Administration. Airspace plans depicting the critical areas for airspace protection are depicted in the ALUCP, Appendix D, Exhibit D3.

<u>Section 3.4.6, page 3-19:</u> (d) Any project submitted to the ALUC for airport land use compatibility review for which FAA notification is required shall include a copy of the e CFR Part 77 notification to the Federal Aviation Administration and the FAA findings, if available.

The project was previously issued a Finding of No Hazard on August 16, 2017, however, this finding expired on February 16, 2019, and a subsequent application was filed on February 25, 2019 (2019-AWP-1849-OE). A photometric study was prepared by the applicant.

Avigation Easement Dedication: As a condition for development approval, the owner of any property proposed for development within Safety Zones: 1 (RPZ), 2 (IADZ), 3 (ITZ), 4 (OADZ), and 5 (SZ) shall be required to dedicate an avigation easement to the entity owning the affected airport. The avigation easement shall: (a) Provide the right of flight in the airspace above the property; (b) Allow the generation of noise and other impacts associated with aircraft overflight; Compatibility Policies and Criteria 3-17 (c) Restrict the height of structures, trees, and other objects; (d) Permit access to the property for the removal or aeronautical marking of objects exceeding the established height limit; and (e) Prohibit electrical interference, glare, and other potential hazards to flight. The City of Fresno is aware that an avigation easement is required.

The project is not within airport noise contours, but an Airport disclosure notice is required.

Commissioner Duarte had questions for Outfront Media. Trent Suntrapack and Mark Duran answered questions that Commissioner Duarte asked about the 65 foot sign.

Commissioner Duarte commented at the last meeting the FAA application had expired and asked if it had been refiled for 7460 with the FAA for review of the structure at this location. Mr. Suntrapack said that the City of Fresno Airports Division had originally done that and have requested an update and that they would have that information.

Jarred Olsen with the City of Fresno said that it was submitted and has not come back.

A motion was made by Steve Rapada and seconded by Daniel Yrigollen to approve at up to 65 feet based on approval by the City of Fresno and approval based on receiving an updated approval letter from the FAA. A vote was called for and the motion carried.

C. <u>Development Permit Application No. P19-00359 proposing the construction of a 86-foot high digital</u> LED back-to-back billboard (Staff: Brenda Veenendaal)

Brenda Veenendaal reported on this item. Development Permit Application No. P19-00359 proposes the construction of an 86-foot high digital LED back-to-back billboard. The billboard dimensions will be 14-feet high by 48-feet wide. It would sit along the east edge of the North Zone 7 (Precision Approach Zone) of Fresno Air Terminal, near State Route 41 between East Alluvial and East Herndon Avenues.

Within this zone ALUC review is required for any proposed object that has a height that would penetrate the airspace protection surface of the airport. Any object that penetrates one of these surfaces is, by FAA definition, considered an obstruction. A proposed object having a height that exceeds the airport's airspace protection surface shall be allowed only if, upon conclusion of the FAA's 7460 review process, the FAA determines that the object would not be a hazard to air navigation.

As stated in the Fresno County ALUCP, 3.4.5, page 3-18 Other Flight Hazards:

New land uses that may cause visual, electronic, or increased bird strike hazards to aircraft in flight shall not be permitted within any airport's influence area. Specific characteristics of land use proposals to be evaluated include:

- (a) Glare or distracting lights which could be mistaken for airport lights;
- (b) Sources of dust, steam, or smoke which may impair pilot visibility;
- (c) Sources of electrical interference with aircraft communications or navigation;

The criteria for limiting the height of structures, trees, and other objects in the vicinity of an airport shall be based upon 14 CFR Part 77, Subpart C, and applicable airport design standards published by the Federal Aviation Administration. Airspace plans depicting the critical areas for airspace protection are depicted in the ALUCP, Appendix D, Exhibit D3.

<u>Section 3.4.6, page 3-19</u>: (d) Any project submitted to the ALUC for airport land use compatibility review for which FAA notification is required shall include a copy of the e CFR Part 77 notification to the Federal Aviation Administration and the FAA findings, if available.

The project was previously issued a Finding of No Hazard on August 16, 2017, however, this finding expired on February 16, 2019, and s subsequent application was filed on February 25, 2019 (2019-AWP-1849-OE). A photometric study was prepared by the applicant.

Avigation Easement Dedication: As a condition for development approval, the owner of any property propose for development within Safety Zone: 1 (RPZ), 2 (IADZ), 3 (ITZ, 4 (OADZ), and 5 (SZ) shall be required to dedicate an avigation easement to the entity owning the affected airport. The avigation easement shall: A (a) Provide the right of flight in the airspace above the property; (b) Allow the generation of noise and other impacts associated with aircraft overflight; Compatibility Policies and Criteria 3-17 (c) Restrict the height of structures, trees, and other object; (d) Permit access to the property for the removal or aeronautical marking of objects exceeding hazards to flight. The City of Fresno is aware that an avigation easement is required.

The project was not within airport noise contours, but an Airport disclosure notice is required.

Commissioner Duarte asked about the height of the sign. Jared Olsen explained that for this zone district the height restriction is also 60 feet however do to the proximity to an elevated freeway they felt that it in order to get a billboard to a height that would be visible to the highway 41 traffic that it would need to be raised. On the site plan submittal the is also a depiction of an elevation that shows the freeway digital billboard at 86 feet above grade as well as the cell towers on site.

A motion was made by Commissioner Rapada and seconded by Commissioner Yrigollen to approve the Development Permit Application No. P19-00359 to propose the construction of a digital LED back-to-back billboard up to 86-feet high based on Outfront Media gaining the City of Fresno variance. A vote was called for and the motion carried.

D. Style-Line Construction, Inc. General Industrial Building Proposal (Staff: Braden Duran)

Braden Duran reported on this item. The City of Fresno, on behalf of Style-Line Construction Inc., is proposing the development of a parcel of land located at 3928 North Blattella Lane in the City of Fresno.

Building: The developer plans to improve on the \pm 1.68 acres of property with the addition of a 24,873 square-foot general industrial shell-building. The property is located in the IL (Light Industrial) zoning

district. The proposed maximum height of the warehouse is 34ft. The structure can be utilized by one to four tenants depending on final interior design. The site is anticipated to observe operating hours of 7:00 am to 7:00 pm Monday-Saturday. Project application notes that general site activity will follow its zoning designation of IL/cz, with heavy duty vehicles including large delivery trucks accessing the building through existing roadways and on-site paved areas for parking and circulation. The site specifications document provided for review state lighting shall be hooded and adhere to illumination standards that do not cause nuisance, which is satisfactory to staff. Developer also notes that no extreme noise, fumes, or glare will result from this proposal.

The site is located within Zone 6, the Traffic Pattern Zone (TPZ), of the Fresno Yosemite International Airport. Specific site location in the TPZ is shown in the safety zone map included in your packet. The ALCUP restrictions on density and open land for the TPZ are not expected to be an issue for this project. Open Space on the lot is projected to be around 64%, which meets the 10% minimum.

Other prohibited land uses in the TPZ include outdoor stadiums or other high intensity uses, as well as hazards to flight.

Other Development Conditions Include:

- Airport disclosure notice
- Airspace review required for objects >100 feet tall

Noise contours - This project straddles the 70db CNEL contour of Fresno Yosemite International Airport. Per Table 3B of the ALUCP on page 3-12, only industrial uses are compatible with the land at this noise level. The proposed project fits within this category.

Further, staff noted that this project sits just north of the runways at Fresno Yosemite International Airport, with potential concerns relating to possible bird attractants at the site as a result of landscaping standards.

A motion was made by Commissioner Darnell and seconded by Commissioner Rapada to recommend the ALUC approve a Finding of Consistency for application P19-00504 for the proposed General Industrial Building by Style-Line Construction and City of Fresno. A vote was called for and the motion carried.

E. <u>Development Permit Application No. P18-03579; Variance Application No. P18-03877 (Staff Braden Duran)</u>

Braden Duran reported on this item. The City of Fresno, on behalf of Pacific Gas & Electric, is seeking approval to construct an outdoor storage yard on the northwest corner of North Thorne and West Voorman Avenues.

Facility: This project would be an addition to an existing storage yard that is directly north of the proposed yard. The project seeks to construct an eight-foot-tall fence to enclose the proposed storage yard. This fence includes an 8' high concrete fence along the West and South side of the property which will match the existing fence, as well the installation of a 7' high wrought iron fence on the East side of the property which will match the existing fence. Project notes also indicate that a new entrance for the site will be installed at the north end of the cul-de-sac of Voorman Ave. Staff would like to note that no structures are proposed with the project.

The site is located within Zone 6, the Traffic Pattern Zone (TPZ), of the Fresno Chandler Executive Airport. Specific site location in the TPZ is shown in the safety zone map included in your packet. The ALUCP restrictions on density and open land for the TPZ are not expected to be an issue for this project. Open Space on the lot will remain at nearly 100%, which meets the 10% minimum. Other prohibited land uses in the TPZ include outdoor stadiums or other high-intensity uses, as well as hazards to flight.

Other Development Conditions Include:

- Airport disclosure notice
- Airspace review required for objects >100 feet tall

Noise contours – This project is located outside of the Chandler airport noise contours and is therefore not subject to any special conditions of site usage. Staff also notes that this project is zoned industrial.

A motion was made by Commissioner Rapada and seconded by Commissioner Kroll to recommend the ALUC approve a Finding of Consistency for application P18-03579 for the proposed Storage Yard and Fencing by PG&E and City of Fresno. A vote was called for and the motion carried.

F. The Orchards II Apartments Expansion –Individual Development Project (Staff: Brenda Veenendaal)

Brenda Veenendaal reported on this item. The proposed project, expansion of an existing apartment complex in northwest Fresno, calls for construction of 64 multi-family dwelling units situated on 3.73 acres. The existing development is located at 5034 W. Bullard Avenue, Fresno 93722. This expansion project would be located on the northeast corner of Bullard Avenue and Dante Avenue immediately West and adjacent to the existing development, within the Bullard Community Plan area.

Project construction will consist of eight multi-family buildings, carports and garages and the necessary landscaping and pedestrian entry at the main entry to the proposed development on Bullard Avenue with additional pedestrian access gates at Dante Avenue. The living units will range in size from 774 square feet (1-BR Unit) to 904 square feet (2-BR Unit), with a distribution of 1- and 2-bedroom units. There will be ample open space throughout the project. The project will be gated, and will feature the use of the existing entry gates located at Bullard Avenue. The architecture of the proposed buildings will match the design of the existing development, of which it will become a part.

Though the applicants project description states that "It is our opinion that the long term environmental effects relative to noise, air pollution, odors, waste by-products, and demand on infrastructure will not have a significant adverse impact on the adjacent neighboring properties, the neighborhood or the city as a whole." No environmental analysis was submitted for review by the ALUC.

The proposed project sits within Zone 6-Traffic Pattern Zone of the Sierra Sky Park Airport's Safety Zones. Project height is just over 29 inches at its highest peak as shown in the attached elevations. The safety criteria for that zone as defined by the Fresno County Airport Land Use Commission's (ALUC) Airport Land Use Compatibility Plan (ALUCP) includes the following three conditions, which should not be of concern:

- No limit on dwelling units per acre
- 10% Required Open Land around the project Open land requirements are intended to be applied with respect to an entire zone. This is typically accomplished as part of a community general plan or a specific plan, but may also apply to large (10 acres or more) development projects.
- Prohibited uses include: Hazards to flight and outdoor stadiums and similar uses with very high intensity uses

Other Development Conditions include the following items which also should not be of concern with this project:

- Airport disclosure notice required
- Airspace review required for objects >100 feet tall
- New structures are prohibited on existing terrain that penetrates 14 CFR Part 77 surfaces
- New structures require additional airspace analysis required within the 50-foot terrain penetration buffer

The proposed project does not sit within the noise contours of Sierra Sky Park Airport.

A motion was made by Commissioner Yrigollen and seconded by Commissioner Beck recommend the ALUC approve a Finding of Consistency for the Orchards II apartment expansion development project. A vote was called for and the motion carried.

3. <u>Public Presentation</u>

None

4. Other Business

a. Items from Staff

None

b. <u>Items from Members</u>

5. ADJOURN

A motion was made by Commissioner Duarte and seconded by Commissioner Remey to adjourn the meeting at 3:31 p.m. A vote was called for and the motion carried.