

**Fresno COG Policy Board
MINUTES
Thursday, April 30, 2020
5:30 PM
VIA TELECONFERENCE**

Members Attending:

Mayor Drew Bessinger, City of Clovis
Mayor Ron Lander, City of Coalinga
Mayor Elsa Lopez, City of Firebaugh
Mayor David Cardenas, City of Fowler
Councilmember Paul Caprioglio, City of Fresno
Mayor Rey Leon, City of Huron
Mayor Pro Tem Gary Yep, City of Kerman
Mayor Michelle Roman, City of Kingsburg
Mayor Rolando Castro, City of Mendota
Mayor Victor Lopez, City of Orange Cove
Mayor Pro Tem Trinidad Pimentel, City of Parlier
Mayor Pro Tem Mary Fast, City of Reedley
Mayor Frank Gonzalez, City of Sanger
Mayor Louis Franco, City of Selma
Michael Navarro, Caltrans
Bryan Rome, Legal Counsel
Tony Boren, Executive Director

Absent:

Mayor Amarpreet Dhaliwal, City of San Joaquin
Supervisor Sal Quintero, County of Fresno

Quorum: At the start of the meeting, there were 14 members representing 82.70% of the population. There was a quorum to conduct business. (Clovis, Coalinga, Firebaugh, Fowler, Fresno City, Huron, Kerman, Kingsburg, Mendota, Orange Cove, Parlier, Reedley, Sanger, Selma).

The meeting was called to order at 5:35pm by Mayor Cardenas (Fowler), Chair.

I. TRANSPORTATION CONSENT ITEMS

- B. Second Quarterly Work Element and Financial Report (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]
- C. City of Fowler Transportation Development Act Claim (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]
- D. City of Huron Transportation Development Act Claim (Les Beshears) [APPROVE]
- E. Modeling On-Call Contract (Kristine Cai) [APPROVE]
- F. Fiscal Year 2019 Transit Productivity Evaluation Report (Jeff Long) [ACCEPT]
- G. Circuit Planner and Engineer - Update on Current Tasks (Braden Duran) [INFORMATION]
- H. California Air Resources Board Approval of AB617 South Central Fresno Community Emissions Reduction Plan (Braden Duran) [INFORMATION]
- I. Regional Transportation Plan Committee Applications and Community Outreach Mini Grant Application (Brenda Veenendaal) [INFORMATION]
 - 1. RTP Roundtable Participant Application (Brenda Veenendaal) [INFORMATION]

Mayor Pro Tem Fast (Reedley) pulled Item I-A. Mayor Leon (Huron) pulled Item I-I-2, Item J and Item K.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Pro Tem Yep (Kerman) motioned and Councilmember Caprioglio (Fresno City) seconded to approve the balance of the consent agenda as presented. A roll call vote was taken 14 yes, members San Joaquin and Fresno County absent. The motion passed.

A. Executive Minutes of February 27, 2020 [APPROVE]

Mayor Pro Tem Fast (Reedley) had a correction to the minutes, she was present at the February meeting representing Reedley. Correction was noted and will be made.

I. Regional Transportation Plan Committee Applications and Community Outreach Mini Grant Application (Brenda Veenendaal) [INFORMATION]

2. Environmental Justice Subcommittee Participant Application (Brenda Veenendaal) [INFORMATION]

Ms. Her-Cole (FCOG) reported that the Environmental Justice (EJ) Subcommittee serves Fresno COG's Transportation Technical Committee (TTC) by assisting staff in setting thresholds for environmental justice populations for the RTP's Environmental Justice Report. The EJ Subcommittee will appoint one member to sit on the RTP Roundtable during the RTP update. The EJ Subcommittee application is available on fresnocog.org under "[Get Involved](#)."

This item was informational only; no further action was required

J. New Deadlines for Open Grant Applications (Trai Her-Cole) [INFORMATION]

Ms. Her-Cole (FCOG) reported that Considering challenges that all agencies are facing due to COVID-19, several open requests for proposals, notices of funding opportunities, and technical assistance program application deadlines have been extended. If you have any questions or anticipate submitting an application and need technical assistance, contact Trai Her-Cole.

This item was informational only; no further action was required

K. Fresno COG Electric Vehicle Readiness Plan Project Update (Trai Her-Cole) [INFORMATION]

Ms. Her-Cole (FCOG) reported that Fresno COG was awarded a Caltrans Planning Grant for an electric vehicle readiness plan to support electric vehicle implementation within Fresno County. This is a preliminary update as to the status to date. The consultant has identified existing conditions impacting the EV market and EV charging, including uptake levels and key influencing factors. Stakeholder engage has wrapped up and some preliminary findings were provided in the annotated agenda.

This item was informational only; no further action was required

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Leon (Huron) motioned and Mayor Lopez (Orange Cove) seconded to approve Item I-A, Item I-I-2, Item J and Item K. A roll call vote was taken 14 yes, members San Joaquin and Fresno County absent. The motion passed.

II. TRANSPORTATION ACTION/DISCUSSION ITEMS

A. 2020 Unmet Transit Needs: Public Hearing Announcement (Todd Sobrado) [INFORMATION]

Mr. Sobrado (FCOG/FAX) reported that this is the public hearing for the 2020 Unmet Transit Needs Assessment. The hearing is being held for staff and the transit agencies to address any public comments received prior to the Fresno COG Policy Board taking action on the report in June.

Public hearing was opened for public comment. There were no public comments. The public hearing was closed.

B. 2021 Regional Active Transportation Program (ATP) Cycle 5 Guidelines, Resolution 2020-11 (Jennifer Soliz) [APPROVE]

Ms. Soliz (FCOG) reported that the State established the Active Transportation Program (ATP) in September 2013. ATP funding is distributed as follows:

- Fifty percent to the State for a statewide competitive program ("Statewide Competitive ATP");
- Ten percent to the small urban and rural area competitive program, managed by the State; and

- Forty percent to the large urbanized area competitive program, with funding distributed by population and managed by the Metropolitan Planning Organization (“Regional ATP”).

Fresno COG is responsible for developing guidelines for the regional ATP and for recommending projects to the California Transportation Commission. The California Transportation Commission (CTC) adopted final 2021 ATP Guidelines on March 25, 2020. There were changes at the statewide level from Cycle 4 to Cycle 5, including new and revised language in categories such as project/program amendments (scope changes), performance metrics, scoring criteria and timely use of funds. Considerable program changes include:

- Updated Disadvantaged Communities criteria to include a Healthy Places Index
- An updated project size threshold for small and medium infrastructure/non-infrastructure projects
- Eligible projects – quick-build project pilot program

The MAG agreed that the regional guidelines and criteria should match the adopted statewide guidelines as closely as possible. Only a few minor differences remain between the statewide guidelines and Fresno COG’s regional guidelines.

The statewide competitive call for projects is now open, and applications will be due to Caltrans on June 15, 2020. Once CTC approves the Regional ATP Guidelines (May 15-16, 2020), the regional call for projects will open, with applications due August 14, 2020.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Pro Tem Fast (Reedley) motioned and Mayor Leon (Huron) seconded to approve Resolution 2020-11 adopting the Fresno COG Regional Competitive Active Transportation Program Guidelines and accept the Multidisciplinary Advisory Group list. A roll call vote was taken 13 yes, members Orange Cove, San Joaquin and Fresno County absent. The motion passed.

C. Fresno County Transportation Network Vulnerability Assessment Final Report (Kristine Cai) [ACCEPT]

Ms. Cai (FCOG) reported that Fresno COG received grant funding from Caltrans under the Senate Bill (SB) 1 Adaptation Planning Grants Program to conduct a Transportation Network Vulnerability Assessment (TNVA) for Fresno County. The TNVA aimed to assist Fresno COG and its member agencies in understanding and adapting to the potential impacts of climate change on the region’s transportation infrastructure. The study’s major work products included a public outreach plan and synopsis, a vulnerability assessment report, and an adaptation strategies report.

The TNVA found that much of the Fresno region’s transportation system and its users are likely to be affected by changing climate conditions. Primary climate-related hazards affecting transportation include flooding, wildfire, extreme temperatures, and precipitation-induced landslides.

One of the analysis’ major components was a risk indicator scoring process that combined relevant data on climate hazards and assets into vulnerability scores representing the relative risks facing different assets. This systemwide process helps identify the most vulnerable assets, which should be assessed at the project level.

The TNVA also identified potential adaptation strategies that can be implemented around the county to prepare for climate change impacts. The resulting list of strategies is intended to act as a menu of various response options, which Fresno COG and its stakeholders can pull from as needed. There are a wide range of responses to consider, including changes to planning, policy, design, operations, and maintenance.

This information can inform the next Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy (RTP/SCS) update and also help local jurisdictions meet the SB 379 requirements, which mandate that all cities and counties address climate adaptation and resiliency strategies in the next revision of their general plans’ safety elements.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Castro (Mendota) motioned and Mayor Lander (Coalinga) seconded to accept the Fresno County Transportation Network Vulnerability Assessment Final Report. A roll call vote was taken 13 yes, members Orange Cove, San Joaquin and Fresno County absent. The motion passed.

D. Regional Transportation Plan Public Opinion Survey Consultant Selection (Brenda Veenendaal) [APPROVE]

Ms. Veenendaal (FCOG) reported that Fresno Council of Governments (Fresno COG) released a request for proposals (RFP) on February 1, 2020, seeking a qualified consultant with substantial experience in designing and conducting opinion surveys whose participants are reflective of the county’s demographics, including the non-English speaking populations. The consultant will be

responsible for ranking the Fresno County community's defined values and transportation funding priorities, with a budget not to exceed \$50,000.

Staff received four proposals from the following firms:

- Rea & Parker Research
- Nichols Research
- Probolsky Research
- Think Now

A scoring committee comprising Fresno COG staff members reviewed and scored the applications, holding phone interviews with each consultant on Thursday, March 5, 2020. The scoring committee recommends Rea and Parker Research for contract award based on the following:

Rea & Parker Research

- Impressive experience in Urban Planning and Public Policy
- Twice as many surveys proposed in two formats, online and telephone
- English, Spanish and Hmong language surveys to mirror Fresno County's population
- Very thorough and detailed approach
- Previous clients included a vast list of municipalities and local governments
- Proposal totaled \$49,850- just under budget

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Castro (Mendota) motioned and Mayor Leon (Huron) seconded to approve Rea & Parker consulting firm completion of the Fresno COG Regional Transportation Plan Public Opinion Survey, and the authorization of Fresno COG's Executive Director to enter into a contract for an amount not to exceed \$50,000. A roll call vote was taken 13 yes, members Orange Cove, San Joaquin and Fresno County absent. The motion passed.

E. Fresno COG Public Participation Plan Draft Update Status (Brenda Veenendaal) [INFORMATION]

Ms. Veenendaal (FCOG) reported that Fresno COG, released the draft 2020 Public Participation Plan (PPP) for its 45-day public review and comment period on March 3, 2020 and closed it on April 17, 2020. No comments were received. On May 28, 2020, the Policy Board will conduct a public hearing on the PPP during its normal monthly meeting at 5:30 PM. Public comments are welcomed at the public hearing or may be submitted in writing for Policy Board consideration via mail or email to Fresno COG staff.

The PPP is intended to give the Policy Board and staff guidance in providing for public involvement and interagency consultation early and often during the regional planning process. It contains policies, guidelines, processes and procedures to which Fresno COG commits while seeking and fostering open public involvement during the decision-making process regarding all matters within its jurisdiction. The PPP also identifies opportunities to be involved in the metropolitan transportation planning process.

After addressing all submitted comments, the Policy Board will consider adopting the 2020 Public Participation Plan, by resolution, on June 25, 2020, at its regularly scheduled meeting.

This item was informational only; no further action was required

F. Senate Bill 743 Implementation Update (Kristine Cai) [INFORMATION]

Ms. Kai (FCOG) reported that Senate Bill 743 (SB 743), passed in 2013, was incorporated in the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) guidelines in December 2018, and will take effect on July 1, 2020. It requires Level of Service (LOS) be replaced with Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) as the metric for transportation impact analyses in the CEQA process. SB 743 is going to result in profound changes to how local land use development projects and transportation capacity projects are approved. It will serve the State's overall climate change goals by encouraging infill development and discouraging greenfield development; supporting green projects, such as transit and active transportation projects and; minimizing capacity-increasing projects.

Fresno COG has been working with the local governments and a consultant team to develop regional guidance and recommendations for SB 743 implementation. The local process has resulted in a 13 percent reduction threshold recommendation based on the new greenhouse gas reduction targets set by the California Air Resources Board for the Fresno region. This compares to the State Office of Planning and Research's (OPR) statewide 15 percent reduction target.

Fresno COG's process has resulted in criteria to help local jurisdictions screen out projects that have less-than-significant VMT impacts. Fresno COG has also distributed draft VMT maps for each jurisdiction, which is one of the screening criteria. Fresno COG staff and the consultant team are working on developing an online VMT calculation tool for projects, and a list of mitigation measures that will work for the region.

Based on the work so far, the SB 743 process will have more impacts on projects in the fringe areas than the urban core, and it will add more of a cost/burden to small cities for growth than to the metropolitan areas. It is consistent with the State's goal of reducing travel-related GHG by concentrating growth in the urban areas, where travel is relatively shorter, than small communities where people tend to travel longer distances.

As part of the CEQA process, project sponsors will need to mitigate the impact to a less-than-significant level to avoid an Environmental Impact Report (EIR). If the impact can't be mitigated, a Statement of Overriding Considerations can be provided through an EIR process, which may be riskier.

There hasn't been any clear guidance from the State on how mitigation measures can be quantified. OPR seems to think on-site mitigation on a project-by-project basis is less effective than coordinated regional efforts, such as a regional mitigation bank or exchange, which is brand new in the VMT arena.

Fresno COG's recommendation will be advisory. The cities and the County will need to make their own judgements on what will work best based on individual growth policies and other considerations, such as economic development. Local government staff is strongly encouraged to stay involved with Fresno COG in the process.

This item was informational only; no further action was required

G. Release of Measure C New Technology Reserve Program 2020 Grant Application (Peggy Arnest) [INFORMATION]

Ms. Arnest (FCOG) reported that Fresno COG is seeking proposals from eligible public agencies for advanced transit and transportation projects that have the potential for broad benefits to Fresno County residents, and will assist the region in meeting its air quality goals. Fresno COG and the Fresno County Transportation Authority (FCTA) are proposing to fund projects of regional significance in research, development, demonstration, and deployment that will advance public transit and transportation. This third cycle of the Measure "C" New Technology Reserve Program will make approximately **\$5.4 million** available for eligible new technology projects/programs. The 2020 application is attached to this item.

Timeline:

ACTIVITY	DATE
Request for Proposals released	April 10, 2020
Last day to submit requests for clarification	June 4, 2020
Deadline for electronic proposal submittal for agencies requesting to partner with Fresno COG	June 18, 2020
Deadline for proposal submittal	July 22, 2020
Scoring (Tentative)	July 27 - August 14, 2020
Potential interview date (tentative)	August 17 - 28, 2020
Policy Board approval (tentative)	September 24, 2020
FCTA Board approval (tentative)	October 28, 2020
Notice to proceed - subject to contract signing (tentative)	January 2021

In February 2016, the Policy Board approved a formal process to solicit and accept members to sit on a Multidisciplinary Advisory Group (MAG). The MAG will review, evaluate and score the New Tech applications and recommend projects for funding. Nominees are needed from the following: City of Fresno, City of Clovis, east side city, west side city, County of Fresno, Measure C Citizens Oversight Committee, FCTA, transit, business, education and two public seats. The MAG application will be released in the early summer. For more information regarding the Measure C New Technology program please visit <http://www.fresnocog.org/measure-c-new-technology-reserve-fund> and/or contact Peggy Arnest at parnest@fresnocog.org.

This item was informational only; no further action was required

H. Caltrans Report (Caltrans) [INFORMATION]

Mr. Navarro (Caltrans) reported:

- Kings Canyon Expressway SR 180 Segment 3; Major traffic shift took place in February, traffic is on the pavement. Work will now focus on the Kings River overflow structure at Minkler and start laying the concrete pavement on the eastbound lanes. The project is estimated to be completed by September.
- State Route 269 Heart of the Valley sign is erected.
- City of Firebaugh new ADA was awarded and granted in the fall. The work is anticipated to be complete this month.
- City of Kingsburg SR 99 rehabilitation - The project was awarded to Granite Construction. Lanes will be reduced from three lanes to two lanes for the duration of the project. This will reduce the project to a total of 240 days as opposed to 5 years if all lanes stayed open. Construction should begin on April 6 and is anticipated to end in spring 2021.
- Caltrans Director Sharri Bender-Ehlert announced her retirement. Her last day will be June 30.
- COVID-19 has not effected projects, bids are still going out and construction continues.
- Gail Miller retired last year and Mr. Navarro has taken over as her permanent replacement.

This item was informational only; no further action was required

III. ADMINISTRATIVE CONSENT ITEMS

A. Monthly Legislative Report (Trai Her-Cole) [INFORMATION]

After an opportunity for public comment, Mayor Leon (Huron) motioned and Mayor Pro Tem Fast (Reedley) seconded to approve the consent agenda as presented. A roll call vote was taken 13 yes, members Orange Cove, San Joaquin and Fresno County absent. The motion passed.

IV. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION/DISCUSSION ITEMS

A. 2020 Valley Voice Sacramento (Robert Phipps/Kristine Cai) [INFORMATION]

Mr. Phipps (FCOG) provided a verbal summary of the San Joaquin Valley COG's 2020 Valley Voice trip to Sacramento that took place in March.

This item was informational only; no further action was required

V. ELECTION OF CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR

Current: Mayor David Cardenas (Fowler) Chair and Mayor Robert Silva (Mendota) Vice Chair

Mayor Pro Tem Yep (Kerman) motioned, seconded by Mayor Lander (Coalinga) to nominate Mayor Cardenas (Fowler) for Chair. A roll call vote was taken 13 yes, members Orange Cove, San Joaquin and Fresno County absent. The motion passed.

Mayor Pro Tem Yep (Kerman) motioned, seconded by Mayor Leon (Huron) to nominate Mayor Roman (Kingsburg) for Vice Chair. A roll call vote was taken 13 yes, members Orange Cove, San Joaquin and Fresno County absent. The motion passed.

VI. OTHER ITEMS

A. Items from Staff

- Mr. Boren – Polled the Board as to their preference for a video conference service. The Board's preference was Zoom.

B. Items from Members

- Mayor Bessinger (Clovis) reported that the City of Clovis will begin to open Council meetings up to public.
- Mayor Roman (Kingsburg) reported that the T-mobile merger has been approved.

VII. PUBLIC PRESENTATIONS

A. Public Presentations

There were no public presentations

Mayor Leon (Huron) motioned and Mayor Beltran (Parlier) seconded to adjourn the meeting. A roll call vote was taken 13 yes, members Orange Cove, San Joaquin and Fresno County absent. The motion passed.

The meeting was adjourned to FCRTA at 6:53 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Tony Boren". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Tony Boren

Public

Tom Gross, WSP

Mote Cox, Fresno EOC

Jamaica Gentry, Caltrans

Staff:

Robert Phipps

Les Beshears

Kristine Cai

Peggy Arnest

Jen Soliz

Trai Her-Cole

Brenda Veenendaal

Braden Duran

Todd Sobrado

Moses Stites

Jeaneen Cervantes