

**Transportation Technical Committee
MINUTES
Friday, March 12, 2021
8:30 AM**

Meeting held via Zoom.

Greg Barfield, City of Fresno-FAX
Carolina Ilic, City of Fresno-FAX
Tina Sumner, Fresno Cycling Club
Scott Mozier, City of Fresno
Mohammad Khorsand, County of Fresno
Mohammad Alimi, County of Fresno
Janelle Del Campo, Fresno County Rural Transit Agency
Christopher Nicholas, Caltrans
Joey Daggett, City of Selma
Michael Osborne, City of Mendota
Debbie Hansaker, Fresno Chamber of Commerce
Jennifer Clark, City of Fresno
Marilu Morales, City of Reedley
Mike Prandini, Business Industry Association
Moses Sties, Fresno County Rural Transit Agency
John Mulligan, City of Sanger
Ryan Burnette, City of Clovis
Tony Boren, Fresno COG

The meeting was called to order at 8:33 a.m. by Mr. Barfield (FAX), Chair.

I. TRANSPORTATION CONSENT ITEMS

- A. Executive Minutes of February 12, 2021 [APPROVE]
- B. Fresno COG Measure C Audit 2018-19 Audit (Les Beshears) [INFORMATION]
- C. Contract Extension for Yosemite Area Regional Transportation System (YARTS) (Peggy Arnest) [APPROVE]
- D. 2020 Annual Productivity Evaluation (Jeff Long) [Accept]
- E. Circuit Planner and Engineer Program Update (Meg Prince) [INFORMATION]

After an opportunity for public comment, Ms. Clark (Fresno City) motioned and Mr. Stites (FCRTA) seconded to approve the consent agenda as presented. The motion passed.

II. TRANSPORTATION ACTION/DISCUSSION ITEMS

A. Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy

1. Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS) Performance Indicators for Public Input (Seth Scott) [APPROVE]

Mr. Scott (FCOG) reported that Performance indicators are the metrics used to determine if a scenario is achieving desired goals, and they are the main tools by which scenarios can be compared with one another. The indicators chosen from the long list of possible metrics are critical to tell a clear and comprehensive story of which scenarios have the most desirable outcomes for the Fresno County region.

Staff has created a short list of indicators that are either critically descriptive of a scenario's design (e.g., housing type mix), or that are specifically enumerated in legislation (e.g., GHG emissions, per SB 375). These indicators will be included for analysis within the Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS). On top of that, staff (with help from the SCS subcommittee) has compiled a longer list of elective indicators that could be included in scenario analysis. The EJ

Subcommittee subsequently met and recommended additional equity indicators to be added to the list. The revised list of proposed indicators is attached.

Staff presented this list to the public in an outreach effort in late March, asking survey participants to weigh in on the indicators that best represent their values and concerns for the future. Staff will return with the results of this outreach in May and will ask the TTC/PAC to recommend which performance indicators from the list should be included in scenario analysis within the SCS.

After discussion the committee reworded Roadway Exposure and removed agricultural land from the listed major polluters. Agricultural lands was specific to herbicides.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Khorsand (Fresno County) motioned and Ms. Sumner (Fresno Cycling) seconded to recommend to the Policy Board approval the attached list of performance indicators for public input. The motion passed.

2. 2022 Regional Transportation Plan Revenue Projections (Suzanne Martinez) [APPROVE]

Ms. Martinez (FCOG) reported that as required by federal transportation law (23CFR450.322), the Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) shall be financially constrained. To meet this requirement, the RTP compares revenue projections for its 25-year planning horizon against all projects submitted during the RTP call-for-projects to ensure that the adopted program of projects will not exceed reasonably foreseeable future revenues. The revenue assumptions include revenue estimates for specific governmental funding programs, local contributions, and tax initiatives.

The attached draft revenue projection lists all reasonably available funding sources, the base year annual funding estimate, the source of the base year estimate, the inflated annual funding estimate in 2026, and the RTP lifetime cumulative estimate based on estimated 2026 dollars. 2026 is used as a starting point for the revenue projections because the first four years of the RTP's planning horizon will be accounted for in the 2023 Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP).

Fresno COG relied on the following assumptions to develop revenue and cost projections:

- The RTP's estimated revenues assume an inflation rate of 2 percent and are reported in expenditure year dollars.
- Local Transportation Fund revenues are assumed to be constant throughout the RTP's life
- The Surface Transportation Block Grant Program (STBG) and Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) Program, will continue or be replaced by similar programs throughout the RTP's life.
- Federal and state transit funds are assumed to remain at their present levels throughout the plan's life.
- Projected state and federal highway revenues reflect the average amounts programmed in the State Transportation Improvement Program (STIP) and are consistent with the CTC-adopted, five-year STIP fund estimate.
- Measure C, Fresno County's local ½-cent sales tax for transportation improvements, will be renewed and/or augmented before it expires in 2027. Voters have extended the measure once already, in 2006.
- The 2026 annual estimates reflect a three-year deficit in revenues due to COVID-19 based on the Fresno County 2019-2050 growth projections, and a U-shaped COVID-19 recovery that assumes economic recovery to 2019 levels by 2022.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Stites (FCRTA) motioned and Ms. Sumner (Fresno Cycling) seconded to recommend the Policy Board approve the attached revenue projections for the 2022 RTP/SCS. The motion passed.

3. Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS) Scenario Concept/Indicator Public Outreach Plan (Brenda Veenendaal) [INFORMATION]

Ms. Veenendaal (FCOG) reported that Fresno COG staff is planning an outreach effort to present the Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS) scenario concepts and list of indicators to the public, gathering input through an online, interactive survey in English and Spanish, very similar to the effort Fresno COG undertook last fall with the RTP Transportation Needs Survey.

To facilitate the survey development, Fresno COG is working with JSA marketing to create a series of very short, animated videos to incorporate within the survey and help brand the Regional Transportation Plan effort with the public.

The scenario concepts have to be simplified to a degree to make them relatable to the public, but still presented accurately. Staff will also use graphics to depict all five concepts before asking participants about their impression of each one. In addition, we will ask the public to prioritize groups of indicators that will be used to assess the performance of each SCS scenario. Then we will ask them which of the indicators within each group are most important to them.

The surveys will be publicized using the following strategies: Videos, e-newsletters, hard-copy flyers with QR codes, email, public Zoom meetings, website posts, organic and boosted posts on Fresno COG's social media channels and presentations to community groups and organizations

Staff is developing the details and timeline for this outreach effort, which is planned to kick-off on March 26 and run through April 25. The outreach results will first be reported to the RTP Roundtable on April 28, then to the TTC/PAC on May 14 and the Fresno COG Policy Board on May 27. When the results are reported, staff will also be asking for a recommendation on the top three scenarios to go forward for SCS modeling and a trimmed-down list of indicators to assess scenario performance.

This item was informational only; no further action was required.

B. 2020 Regional Transit Safety Performance Targets (Santosh Bhattarai) [APPROVE]

Mr. Bhattarai (FCOG) reported Each MPO is responsible for integrating performance measures from Public Transportation Agency Safety Plan (PTASP) into its planning processes as stated by 23 CFR § 450.306(d)(4). The transit agencies are supposed to submit the targets they developed in the safety plan to the MPOs. The safety targets from transit agencies will be reported as part of the Transportation Performance Management (TPM) system report in Fresno COG's Federal Transportation Improvement Program and Regional Transportation Plan. Transit agencies in the PTASP set annual targets for seven safety performance measures as follows:

- Number of fatalities
- Number of fatalities per 10 million vehicle revenue miles (VRM)
- Number of passenger injuries
- Number of passenger injuries per 10 million vehicle revenue miles (VRM)
- Number of accidents/incidents (safety events)
- Number of accidents/incidents per 10 million vehicle revenue miles (VRM)
- System reliability

There are three transit agencies in Fresno County: Fresno Area Express (FAX), Clovis Transit, and Fresno County Rural Transit Agency (FCRTA). FAX is the sole agency in the region required by FTA to develop the PTASP and set the annual transit safety targets. Clovis Transit and FCRTA are exempted from the PTASP requirements. Hence, the regional annual transit safety targets would be the same as that of FAX presented below. 2020 goals represent a 10% reduction of 2019 actuals.

2020 Regional Transit Safety Performance Targets							
Mode	Fatalities	Fatalities (per 10 million VRM)	Injuries	Injuries (per 10 million VRM)	Accidents /Incidents	Accidents/Incidents (per 10 million VRM)	System Reliability
Bus Transit	0	0	42	8.19×10^{-3}	46	8.97×10^{-3}	11,986

After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Rousseau (Fresno County) motioned and Mr. Mozier (Fresno City) seconded to recommend the Policy Board adopt the regional transit safety performance targets for 2020. The motion passed.

C. Fresno COG Transportation Control Measure (TCM) Substitution (Braden Duran) [APPROVE]

Mr. Duran (FCOG) reported that Transportation Control Measures (TCMs) are defined as transportation projects or programs that adjust trip patterns or otherwise modify vehicle use in ways that reduce air pollutant emissions, and are specifically identified and committed to in the most recently approved State Implementation Plan (SIP). TCMs are included in a SIP as part of the overall control strategy to demonstrate a region's ability to attain the National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS).

In the Fresno COG region, TCM-type projects are considered committed once they have funds programmed in an approved Fresno COG Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP). When a committed TCM cannot be delivered or will be significantly delayed, the substitution of the TCM is required and follows the process specified under the Clean Air Act §176(c).

In consultation with the City of Huron, Caltrans, and the City of Clovis. Fresno COG is making a request to substitute the Lassen Avenue/State Route 269 Traffic Signals project, which is included as a committed TCM in the San Joaquin Valley SIP (FTIP ID: FRE020135) with a traffic signal synchronization project along Shepherd Avenue in the City of Clovis. For further details about the proposed TCM substitution, please refer to the attached report.

The Draft TCM Substitution Report was circulated through the San Joaquin Valley Interagency Consultation (IAC) group on Dec. 18, 2021 and received preliminary concurrence from CARB and EPA. The draft report was then released for a 30-day public review and comment period on Jan. 26 with a public hearing held by COG staff on Feb. 16. No comments were received during the period or at the hearing.

As documented in the draft Fresno COG TCM Substitution Report, the proposed substitution is consistent with federal and state requirements, including the federal planning requirements and the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's (EPA) transportation conformity rule. The TCM substitution does not require a new conformity determination or a formal SIP revision. The San Joaquin Valley region maintains transportation conformity after the substitution.

Once Fresno COG adopts the TCM substitution (with concurrence of EPA and ARB), Fresno COG will remove the City of Huron project from the most recently approved FTIP and subsequently program the City of Clovis project in the next available amendment. Both projects were/are funded by the competitive portion of Fresno COG's Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) program.

Fresno COG is requesting a TCM substitution to replace the City of Huron's traffic signal(s) TCM project with a signal synchronization project in the City of Clovis. Fresno COG staff has determined that the proposed TCM substitution meets all Federal Clean Air Act TCM substitution requirements.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Stites (FCRTA) motioned and Mr. Khorsand (Fresno County) seconded to recommend the Policy Board adopt the transportation control measure (TCM) substitution, via resolution, and direct staff to forward it to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) and the California Air Resources Board (ARB) for concurrence. The motion passed.

D. 2021 Cycle 5 Regional Active Transportation Program Recommendations (Jennifer Soliz) [APPROVE]

Ms. Soliz (FCOG) reported that Active Transportation Program (ATP) funds are separated into three main components: the statewide competitive program, the small urban- and rural-area competitive program (managed by the state), and the large, urbanized area competitive program [managed by Metropolitan Planning Organizations (MPOs)] – also known as the Regional Competitive ATP. Large MPOs such as Fresno COG have the option of developing their own policies, procedures and project selection criteria that differ from those the California Transportation Commission (CTC) adopted, provided the CTC approves them. The Policy Board approved the regional ATP guidelines on July 30, 2020.

The state initiated its ATP call for projects from March 25 through Sept. 15, 2020. The state also solicited applications for a small number of quick-build projects for the 2021 ATP as a pilot program this ATP cycle. Quick-build applications were due July 15, 2020.

This region submitted 14 applications with a total project cost of \$20.9 million. One of the applications was submitted to the quick-build pilot program. All applications were also eligible for the regional program. Agencies were encouraged to

apply to the state competitive program but had the option to submit applications to the region. Staff received one additional application. Supplemental applications were due to Fresno COG on Nov. 20, 2020.

Four projects were awarded through the statewide competitive program and the quick-build pilot program for a total of \$6.06 million. These projects were no longer considered for the regional program.

ATP Cycle 5 will cover four years of funding – FY 2021-22 through FY 2024-25. Fresno COG's share provides \$4.8 million. At least 25 percent of program funds must benefit projects in disadvantaged communities.

The regional scoring committee convened on Feb. 25 to score and deliberate on the recommended program of projects. The scoring committee comprised representatives from City of Fresno, Fresno County, Eastside, Westside, Caltrans, FCOG, a bike expert and a non-government organization. The recommended program of projects is attached and can also be found on Fresno COG's ATP website: <https://www.fresnocog.org/project/active-transportation-program-atp/>. Please note that the programming years can vary based on funding capacity for each year.

To summarize the proposed recommendations:

- The scoring committee recommended that \$4.815 million in ATP funds be programmed for four projects and one partially funding project.
- All of the recommended projects are located within and directly benefit disadvantaged communities, well exceeding the 25 percent minimum.
- All fully funded projects are Safe Routes to School projects.
- The City of Coalinga will be awarded PE and partial ROW funding to get this project shovel-ready

Below is the schedule for adopting the Cycle 5 program of projects:

- Fresno COG Policy Board adopts recommendations: March 2021
- Deadline to submit the DRAFT program of projects to CTC staff: April 15, 2021
- Deadline to submit the FINAL program of projects to CTC staff: May 14, 2021
- CTC adopts MPO programs of projects: June 2021 meeting
- Fresno COG 2021 FTIP amendment to incorporate the approved Cycle 5 ATP projects: Fall 2021

After an opportunity for public comment, Ms. Hansaker (Chamber) motioned and Mr. Alimi (Fresno County) seconded to recommend the Policy Board approve the Cycle 5 Regional Competitive Active Transportation Program of Projects by adopting resolution 2021-11. The motion passed.

E. Fresno County Regional Trails Plan (Peggy Arnest) [ACCEPT]

Item pulled by staff. Item will be brought back next month.

F. Local Planning Factor Survey for Sixth-Cycle Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) Plan (Meg Prince) [INFORMATION]

Ms. Prince (FCOG) reported that As required by California Government Code, Section 65584.04, Fresno COG is administering a survey of its member jurisdictions to collect information on factors to be considered in developing the RHNA plan methodology. The survey will address all issues required by state law.

The state requires that COGs develop a report summarizing the input received through the survey, and that it be posted to the COG's website. The report will describe common themes and effective strategies employed by cities and the County, as well as to identify significant barriers to constructing housing at all income levels and affirmatively furthering fair housing.

The survey will be open through Wednesday, March 31, 2021. Staff will also provide an update on the Sixth-Cycle RHNA Plan and the preliminary draft allocation from the California Department of Housing and Community Development.

This item was informational only; no further action was required.

G. Measure C Reauthorization (MC3) Update (Tony Boren) [INFORMATION]

Mr. Boren (FCOG) reported that Following several rounds of discussion over the course of the last two years by both the Fresno COG and Fresno County Transportation Authority (FCTA) policy boards, the two entities agreed to move forward

with a Measure C renewal (MC3) process that will culminate in a ballot measure before Fresno County voters in November 2022.

Although the original intent was to kick off the MC3 renewal process last year, that effort was delayed until 2021 due to the COVID pandemic. The Measure C3 Executive Committee and the Technical Working Group (TWG) each held their first meetings on Feb. 4 and Feb. 25, respectively. These meetings focused on introducing committee members, as well as the measure's background, history and achievements over its 34-year history.

The agendas and the presentations for both kick-off meetings are included as attachments to provide additional details on the specifics of each. Also included is a public participation/outreach graphic that highlights opportunities for public input into the crafting the MC3 expenditure plan.

The Measure C3 Executive Committee will be building off the success of the 2006 plan, and is co-chaired by Lynne Ashbeck, FCTA Vice Chairman and David Cardenas, FCOG Chairman. The executive committee comprises community leaders representing a wide cross-section of agencies, businesses and interest groups. Committee members will represent their particular industry, agency, or group, but will also have a higher view of the overall transportation needs in Fresno County.

Fresno COG/FCTA staff believes the executive committee represents a wide variety of transportation viewpoints from all segments of the community, including public, private and community-based organizations. FCTA/COG staff believe the executive committee includes members who represent a wide swath of the diversity found throughout Fresno County. With careful deliberation, FCTA and Fresno COG management and staff worked to identify committee positions that will provide leadership representation from a large variety of geographic, economic, educational, environmental, socioeconomic and community sectors throughout Fresno County.

When seeking individuals to fill the board-approved positions, staff openly considered racial, gender, geographic and socioeconomic diversity factors, and is grateful to those who agreed to serve their communities. All members are respected community leaders, recognized for their abilities to build consensus, with a desire to ensure our region has a plan to meet future mobility needs of all Fresno County residents. In the end, staff is confident that the Executive Committee will represent the citizens of Fresno County well, and is reflective of the region's diverse population.

As was outlined in numerous staff reports, given the success of our two previous Measure C programs (1986 -2006/2006-present) the prevailing wisdom is that it would be prudent to build on the success of those earlier measures where possible (78% voter support) rather than "reinventing" a brand new process. Each of the earlier expenditure plans was developed through a combination of technical, data-driven input from transportation professionals, as well as input from a wide variety of transportation stakeholders, interested advocacy groups and the general public. Most importantly, both the 2006 and the MC3 renewal expenditure plans were, and will be, guided by extensive public polling to ensure the committee process reflects projects/programs that Fresno County voters would/will support.

However, there is one primary difference between the 2006 and the MC3 processes. In 2006, the Measure C Steering Committee acted in basically the same capacity that the MC3 TWG will. Each of these committees comprise(d) a wide assortment of transportation stakeholders, including: member agency public works and planning staff, urban/rural transit staff, trail/bike advocates, air district staff, Caltrans, ADA/seniors, economic development, etc., and the public. In 2006, the steering committee participated heavily in drafting the expenditure plan. Once regional consensus on the draft expenditure plan was forged, it moved directly to the COG and FCTA process for approval, followed by a Board of Supervisors vote to place it on the ballot.

Staff believes that the circumstances in 2022 are considerably different than they were in 2006, and that some adjustments to the process are desirable and beneficial. In addition, FCTA staff and its consultant VRPA have discussed recent renewal efforts with other "self-help" county agencies in California. While each agency is unique and different, there were common themes that emerged from these discussions.

- Steering committees were not comprised of special interest representatives or modal advocates but rather of community leaders of various public and private backgrounds. Community leaders are in a better position to have an overarching vision for the county and its communities, and would have significant credibility countywide with the public.
- Results of prior measures demonstrated the validity of the modal programs contained in the expenditure plans; therefore, no major changes were proposed. Instead, the steering committees focused on how much each program would receive.

- Special interests and modal advocates were represented in the process through the County's RTP and/or various subcommittee processes.
- Advocates for each mode had the opportunity to be heard and to present their needs and funding shortfalls.
- The steering committees made the final call on recommended funding allocations to be included in final draft expenditure plans to be considered by authority boards and then the voters.

These commonalities mirror the circumstances here in Fresno County. Our existing Measure C Expenditure Plan addresses transportation solutions as diverse as new freeways to transit-oriented development. There is no need to rehash the overall program, but rather a critical look at the funding allocations for the various programs needed in the future. There may be some tweaking required, but not a full-scale revision.

Another difference between now and 2006 is that beginning in 2014, Fresno COG developed Fresno County's first Regional Transportation Plan & Sustainable Communities Strategy (RTP/SCS). This plan is the Fresno County region's long-range transportation vision, and is updated every four years. The RTP/SCS process includes a robust outreach and stakeholder involvement process and integrates all modes of transportation along with land use and housing, environmental issues, reduction of vehicle miles traveled, and other related issues. The RTP/SCS is one of the critical building blocks that will help guide the 2022 renewal effort and identify needs and funding requirements.

FCTA and FCOG staff have had lengthy discussions on how to capitalize on what worked in 2006, but also reflect the current environment and strategies used successfully elsewhere in the state. Staff has settled on a model that we believe will do just that.

Working below the Executive Committee will be a Measure C3 Technical Working Group (TWG). This working group will be where the "nuts and bolts" of the draft expenditure plan are developed. The MC3 TWG will be similar in composition to FCOG's RTP Roundtable, which comprises diverse representatives from: all local agencies; state agencies with transportation or transportation-related responsibilities; modal advocates; special interest groups and; the general public. It will be this group's responsibility to identify all transportation needs (by mode), existing funding available to the various modes, and the funding shortfall for each mode. The TWG will then match the funding shortfalls with the funding potentially available through a MC3.

Even with Measure C3, there will still be a funding shortfall; therefore, this group will need to make preliminary recommendations to the executive committee on appropriate funding levels for each program, recognizing that all needs cannot be met. Ultimately, the process will result in a draft MC3 Expenditure Plan that reflects regional consensus at the TWG level. This draft plan will then move forward to the Executive Committee for review and revisions if deemed appropriate.

Attachments to this staff report are also included to provide greater detail on how the MC3 Technical Working Group (TWG), as well as the MC3 Executive Committee, are composed.

This item was informational only; no further action was required.

III. Election of Chair and Vice Chair

Current:

Greg Barfield (Fresno City), Chair

Mohammad Alim (Fresno County), Vice Chair

Greg Barfield, Fresno Area Express was nominated as Chair and Mohammad Alimi, Fresno County was nominated as Vice Chair.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Khorsan (Fresno County) motioned and Ms. Sumner (Fresno Cycling) seconded to appoint Mr. Barfield as Chair and Mr. Alimi as Vice Chair. The motion passed.

IV. OTHER ITEMS

A. Items from Staff

There were no items from staff.

B. Items from Members

There were no items from members.

VII. PUBLIC PRESENTATIONS

A. Public Presentations –

There were no public presentations.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:24am

Respectfully submitted,



Tony Boren

Public:

Denise Debenedetto, FCTA

Gloria Hensley

Karla Martinez, LCJA

Matthew Gillian, Inspiration Transportation

Mike Leonardo, FCTA

Monte Cox, FCEOC

Joe Vargas, FAX

Kevin Meikle, COF Airports

Nick Paladino, Fresno Cycling Club

Shelby McNab, City of Fresno

Shelby Elia, City of Clovis

Kevin Hall, Public

Staff:

Kai Han, Braden Duran, Trai Her-Cole, Kristine Cai, Robert Phipps, Seth Scott, Brenda Veenendaal, Jen Soliz, Meg Prince, Suzanne Martinez, Peggy Arnest, Santosh Bhattarai, Moses Stites, Janelle Del Campo, Jeff Long, Jeaneen Cervantes