

Transportation Technical Committee  
MINUTES  
Friday, October 13, 2023  
8:30 AM

The meeting was held at FCOG Sequoia Conference Room.

Ryan Burnett, City of Clovis  
Mohammad Alimi, County of Fresno  
Jill Gormley, City of Fresno  
Jennifer Clark, City of Fresno  
Michael Osborn, City of Mendota  
Marilu Morales, City of Reedley  
Nick Paladino, Fresno Cycling Club  
Tony Boren, Fresno Council of Governments  
Moses Stites, Fresno County Rural Transit Agency

The meeting was called to order at 8:30 a.m. by Mr. Stites (FCRTA), Chair.

**I. TRANSPORTATION CONSENT ITEMS**

- A. Executive Minutes of September 8, 2023 [APPROVE]**
- B. Transportation Development Act (TDA) Claims (Les Beshears)**
  - 1. City of Coalinga TDA Claim FY 2022-23 (Les Beshears) [ACTION]
  - 2. City of Clovis TDA Claim FY 2023-24 (Les Beshears) [ACTION]
  - 3. County of Fresno TDA Claim FY 2022-23 (Les Beshears) [ACTION]
- C. 2023 FTA Section 5310 Funding Application Approval (Brenda Thomas) [ACTION]**
- D. 2022-23 Obligational Authority Update (Ofelia Abundez) [INFORMATION]**
- E. Transportation Development Act 2022-23 Surplus (Les Beshears) [INFORMATION]**
- F. Fresno COG's 2023-24 Overall Work Program Amendment No. 2 (Les Beshears) [ACTION]**
- G. Federal Call For Projects/Applications Received (Ofelia Abundez) [INFORMATION]**
- H. Fresno County Mobility Hub Study (Simran Jhutti) [INFORMATION]**
- I. Fresno County Climate Resiliency Plan (Jennifer Rodriguez) [INFORMATION]**

- Mrs. Tucker called for any items wishing to be pulled by members or the public.
- After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Khorsand (County of Fresno) motioned, and Ms. Clark (City of Fresno) seconded to approve the consent agenda items A-I as presented.

**All in Favor, no opposed.  
Motion passed.**

**II. TRANSPORTATION ACTION/DISCUSSION ITEMS**

- A. Fresno COG Regional Vehicles Miles Traveled (VMT) Mitigation Program Study (Santosh Bhattarai) [ACTION]**  
**Summary:** SB 743 requires that level-of-service (LOS), used in measuring transportation impacts in the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), be replaced with vehicle miles traveled (VMT).

Fresno COG developed its SB 743 Implementation Regional Guidelines in 2020, which provided tools for local governments to implement SB 743, should they decide to institute the recommendations. However, due to a lack of clear guidance, VMT mitigation remains an outstanding issue within SB 743 implementation. Projects with significant VMT impacts can't move forward due to a lack of defined, quantifiable and feasible mitigation measures.

This study evaluated potential regional VMT mitigation programs to meet the CEQA transportation mitigation needs for the 16 jurisdictions comprising Fresno COG. Existing VMT mitigations that often rely heavily on existing transportation demand management (TDM) options are inadequate to fully mitigate many of the planned land use and transportation projects. As such, this study considers whether a programmatic approach, primarily through fee assessments to pay for VMT-reducing projects, is a feasible solution to address transportation-related CEQA mitigation needs within the Fresno region.

Several programmatic approaches to VMT mitigation, including VMT banking, VMT exchanges, and VMT mitigation impact fee programs were considered and analyzed. After completing the project analyses, outreach, framework evaluations, and reviewing all considerations, consultant Kimley-Horn determined that a fee-based VMT mitigation program is a feasible option for the Fresno COG region, and that VMT banking would be the most appropriate initial program framework. A variation of VMT banking, called VMT banking plus, which allows a project applicant to select a project to implement from a predetermined list, was also considered favorable. All these programs were identified as being the most appropriate given that they are more easily understood by the public and decision-makers.

Implementing a fee-based VMT mitigation program adds a new fee that may further increase the cost of housing and other development, as well as increase the cost of any capacity-enhancing projects. However, in the absence of more VMT mitigation solutions, significant uncertainty will remain for many projects, including those that might align with other plans and programs, continuing to impede their ability to progress. This regional program will be adopted by individual jurisdictions at their discretion and does not exclude them from doing their own VMT mitigation program.

Kimley-Horn, the consulting firm who conducted the regional VMT mitigation program study, will be offering a brief presentation to the TTC/PAC. The final report, completed in September 2023, is also attached to this agenda.

**Action:** Staff requests that the TTC/PAC recommend the Policy Board accept the Fresno COG Regional VMT Mitigation Program Study Final Report.

- Santosh Bhattarai (FCOG) provided an update of the Mitigation Program Study.
- A presentation was given by Michael Schmitt and Chris Gregerson.
- After an opportunity for public comment, Ms. Clark (City of Fresno) motioned, and Mr. Burnett (Clovis) seconded to approve the action as presented.

**All in Favor, no opposed.**

**Motion passed.**

#### **B. Fresno County Multijurisdictional Housing Element-Contract Amendment (Juan Ramirez) [ACTION]**

**Summary:** Fresno Council of Governments and Placeworks consultants are requesting an amendment to the Fresno County Multijurisdictional Housing Element (MJHE) contract. The housing element is the only general plan element that requires State Housing and Community Development Department (HCD) approval before being adopted. The general plan covers the planning period from 2023-2031. Each jurisdiction is responsible for completing their own housing element as an appendix to the Fresno County Multi-Jurisdictional Housing Element.

As a result of state requirements, each jurisdiction has faced its own set of obstacles, and has required additional resources to complete their housing element by the Dec. 31, 2023 deadline.

The initial April 29, 2022 agreement included a budget of \$1,895,000. Placeworks is proposing a contract change order for additional funding to remaining tasks, including additional housing element land inventory analyses, more time to address new HCD requirements, and additional project administration costs, all totaling \$210,125.

Due to HCD requirements new to this cycle, participating jurisdictions have needed additional time and resources to meet the Dec. 31, 2023, deadline. Fresno COG proposes to amend the contract to avoid future sanctions for the region. For example, several federal, state, and regional funding programs consider housing element compliance as an eligibility or ranking criteria. To ensure future funding, it is crucial that the multi-jurisdictional Housing element follows HCD requirements by the deadline.

All participating jurisdictions will require additional funding to complete the public review draft documents for various reasons, including: staff turnover and/or additional modifications such as sites inventories, GIS maps, etc.

Up to \$1 million in funding for the MJHE and this amendment will come from Fresno COG's share of the Regional Early Action Planning (REAP) program; however, each jurisdiction may be responsible for its own expenses incurred for any work that is required beyond this amendment.

**Action:** Staff requests that the TTC/PAC recommend the Policy Board authorize the executive director to approve a contract amendment with Placeworks for the multijurisdictional housing element in an amount not to exceed \$210,125.

- Juan Ramirez (FCOG) gave an update on the Housing Element Contract Amendment.
- After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Khorsand (County of Fresno) motioned, and Ms. Clark (City of Fresno) seconded to approve the action as presented.

**All in Favor, no opposed.**

**Motion passed.**

**C. Fresno COG REAP 2.0 Call for Applications (Brenda Thomas/Robert Phipps) [INFORMATION]**

**Summary:** Fresno COG is accepting applications for the Regional Early Action Planning (REAP 2.0) program. Administered by the California departments of Housing and Community Development (HCD), Air Resources Board (ARB), Strategic Growth Council and the Governor's Office of Planning and Research, REAP 2.0 seeks to accelerate infill housing, reduce vehicle miles traveled (VMT), and affirmatively further fair housing through innovative projects. Fresno COG received \$13.6 million in funding for this effort. Fresno COG's member agencies and subconsultant partners can apply Oct. 1– Dec. 15, 2023. Learn more at Fresno COG's REAP 2.0 webpage.

**Eligibility**

- All of Fresno COG's member agencies are eligible to apply
- Community-based organizations and developers can apply as a subconsultant to a member agency

**Project Eligibility Requirements**

Projects must meet HCD's strict criteria and demonstrate adherence to all REAP 2.0 program objectives:

- Accelerate infill housing development
- Reduce vehicle miles traveled (VMT)
- Increase housing supply at all affordability levels
- Affirmatively further fair housing
- Facilitate the implementation of adopted regional and local plans

**Key Dates**

- Oct. 1, 2023: Project application opens to all Fresno COG member agencies
- TBD November: Fresno COG will hold virtual office hours for prospective applicants to learn more and ask questions
- Dec. 15, 2023: Project application period closes
- December 2023-January 2024: Scoring Committee convenes to review and score applications received
- January-February 2024: Recommendations to be finalized and submitted to the Board for consideration

**Learn More** - Visit Fresno COG's REAP 2.0 program webpage to learn more.

**Join the Scoring Committee:** Project applications will be evaluated and scored by a scoring committee panel. Scoring committee members will be selected through a fully transparent, inclusive, and equitable process. If you are interested in serving on the committee, please contact Brenda Thomas at [bthomas@fresnocog.org](mailto:bthomas@fresnocog.org).

**Action:** Information/discussion. The Committee may provide additional information at its discretion.

- Brenda Thomas (FCOG) informed members of the REAP 2.0 call for applications.
- This item is informational only; no action is needed.

**D. Measure C Renewal Update (Tony Boren) [INFORMATION]**

**Summary:** Over the last several months, a group of 10 proponents and opponents of the recent Measure C renewal effort have been meeting in an effort to determine if there was enough “trust” between both sides to continue work on a new renewal effort. Based on several conversations with stakeholders who participated, collectively, there does not appear to be consensus for the 2024 election cycle.

One of the challenges with a sales tax renewal effort is that the public sector is responsible for developing the expenditure plan, but once that plan has been approved by the appropriate public sector bodies, the process moves into the hands of the private sector, which must raise campaign funds to help ensure passage.

Keep in mind, when it comes to sales tax measures, the public sector can only “educate”, not “advocate.” It is up to the private sector to raise the campaign funds to “advocate” for passage of the measure.

The immediate issue or concern is that the public sector could develop a Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan for the 2024 ballot that has strong support among the public sector, but if there is no private sector support to raise the campaign funds necessary for passage, the effort would likely be pointless.

In addition, in analyzing the potential for having a Measure C renewal on the 2024 ballot, there are two very important, related, statewide ballot measures to consider. The first is Assembly Constitutional Amendment 1 (ACA 1), which the State Legislature recently approved for the November 2024 ballot. In summary, ACA 1:

...would authorize a local government to impose, extend, or increase a sales and use tax or transactions and use tax imposed in accordance with specified law or a parcel tax, as defined, for the purposes of funding the construction, rehabilitation, or replacement of public infrastructure, affordable housing, or permanent supportive housing if the proposition proposing that tax is approved by 55% of its voters voting on the proposition and the proposition includes specified accountability requirements.

If ACA 1 is approved by the voters (requires 50%+1 to pass), the Measure C renewal would only require a 55% threshold for approval. Keep in mind, the 2022 renewal effort resulted in 58% support despite considerable opposition.

The other statewide ballot measure that has qualified for 2024 is the Taxpayer & Government Accountability Act (TGAA). If passed, this would raise the percentage threshold required for citizen initiative tax increases from the current 50% plus one threshold to a two-thirds (66.1%) vote.

FCTA and COG staff do not believe that sufficient time exists to develop a “new” Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan with the requisite public outreach and community participation process, and still have time for the private sector to raise campaign funds.

In terms of the renewal planning process, ideally the expenditure plan would be approved by the Board of Supervisors (BOS) sometime in early spring (April/May) 2024. The earlier BOS approval date would then allow the private sector to begin its campaign and fundraising efforts much sooner and increase the chances of passage.

Arguably just as important, the results of ACA 1 and TGAA will not be known until after the November 2024 election, so the question when developing an expenditure plan for the 2024 ballot becomes - what is the necessary threshold for passage - 55% or 66%? An expenditure plan that requires 55% voter support for passage will likely look much different than one that requires 66% support.

One of the issues that affected the outcome of the 2022 renewal effort was the last-minute rush to obtain concurrence from each of the cities and the County Board of Supervisors (BOS). Changes offered to the plan near the end of that process led to wavering support from critical constituents and ultimately voter confusion.

Further, as noted above, BOS final approval did not occur until mid-August, which hampered efforts to raise the funds necessary to pursue a successful campaign. As a result, staff believes that a 2026 target for renewal is more appropriate. Given the existing time constraints, the only way to consider a renewal effort in 2024 would be to simply rerun the plan presented in November of 2022.

Somewhat independent of renewal, but critical to identifying the pavement needs within our region, Fresno COG will be hiring a consultant to update our existing countywide pavement condition survey. The last pavement survey was conducted before last year’s significant winter storms.

Based on all three surveys FCTA commissioned, it remains clear that fixing roads remains the public's No. 1 priority. Data from this new countywide pavement condition survey will be critical for determining the level of investment necessary to bring roads throughout Fresno County from poor/fair to good condition.

Recommendation: Fresno COG and FCTA staff are recommending that both agencies begin preparing for a November 2026 renewal of Measure C. The first step should be a Fresno COG/FCTA review of the summary report of the group of 10 meetings. That would be followed by engaging a survey firm to reassess voter priorities as they relate to renewing Measure C.

- Tony Boren (FCOG) gave an update on the Measure C Renewal next process.
- This item is informational only. No action is needed.

### III. OTHER ITEMS

#### A. Items from Staff

- Simran Jhutti (FCOG) announced the kickoff of PCAP on October 25<sup>th</sup>. Need 1 rep for the Stakeholder Steering Committee.
- Tony Boren (FCOG) announced the Fresno State Transportation Innovations Pedal Summit on October 27, 2023

#### B. Items from Members

- None.

### IV. PUBLIC PRESENTATIONS

#### A. Public Presentations

- Tony Molina, Chair of the Fresno County Transportation Institute, announced the 2023 Pedal Summit on October 27, 2023.

### VI. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 9:34 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Tony Boren

#### Public:

None.

#### Staff:

Denise Flores, Simran Jhutti, Robert Phipps, Janelle Del Campo, Shichen Fan, Pankaj Joshi, Brenda Thomas, Les Beshears, Ofelia Abundez, Juan Ramirez, Kai Han.