

Transportation Technical Committee
MINUTES
Friday, June 10, 2022
8:30 AM
Via Zoom and at COG Sequoia Conference Room

Meeting held via Zoom.

Moses Stites, Fresno County Rural Transit Agency
Mohammad Khorsand, County of Fresno
Jennifer Clark, City of Fresno
Scott Mozier, City of Fresno
Renee Mathis, City of Clovis
Christopher Xiong, Caltrans
Debbie Hunsaker, Alert-O-Lite Inc.
Amy Hance, City of Clovis Transit
Nick Paladino, Fresno Cycling Club
Marilu Morales, City of Reedley
Jennifer Clark, City of Fresno

The meeting was called to order at 8:33 a.m. by Mr. Stites (FCRTA), Chair.

I. TRANSPORTATION CONSENT ITEMS

- A. Executive Minutes of May 13, 2022 [APPROVE]
- B. Transportation Development Act (TDA) Claims
- C. Appeals Procedure for the Sixth Cycle Regional Housing Need Allocation (Meg Prince) [ACTION]
- D. Measure C New Tech Program 2022 Request for Proposals (Braden Duran) [INFORMATION]
- E. Fresno County Urban and Rural Consolidated Transportation Services Agency Operations Program and Budget, FY 2022-2023 (Todd Sobrado) [ACTION]
- F. Clovis Consolidated Transportation Services Agency Operations Program and Budget, FY 2022-2023 (Todd Sobrado) [ACTION]
- G. Reappointments for the Social Services Transportation Advisory Committee (Todd Sobrado) [ACTION]
- H. Fresno County Rural Transit Agency 2022-23 Annual Budget (Moses Stites) [ACTION]
- I. Temporary Buy America Waiver for Construction Materials (Robert Phipps) [INFORMATION]
- J. Federal Transit Administration Transit-Oriented Development Planning Pilot Program (Robert Phipps) [INFORMATION]

After an opportunity for public comment, Ms. Mathis (Clovis) motioned and Ms. Morales (Reedley) seconded to approve the consent items as presented. The motion passed.

II. TRANSPORTATION ACTION/DISCUSSION ITEMS

A. Final Sixth-Cycle Regional Housing Need Allocation Methodology (Meg Prince) [ACTION]

Ms. Prince (FCOG) reported that following the Policy Board's direction on Feb. 24, Fresno COG submitted the Draft RHNA Methodology to the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) for a 60-day review. HCD has completed its review and found that the Draft RHNA Methodology furthers the statutory objectives described in Government Code 65584(d).

Fresno COG is requesting that the Policy Board approve the final methodology so that it may be included in the Draft RHNA Plan, which will be released for a 45-day public review period beginning July 5 and ending on Aug. 19.

All aforementioned documents are available on Fresno COG's RHNA webpage:

<https://www.fresnocog.org/project/fresno-county-regional-housing-needs-allocation-plan/>

Please contact Meg Prince, Senior Regional Planner, at mprince@fresnocog.org with questions or comments.

Action: Staff requests that the TTC/PAC recommend the Policy Board approve Resolution 2022-17, approving the Final RHNA Methodology for inclusion in the Draft Sixth-Cycle RHNA Plan.

Ms. Mathis (Clovis) expressed Clovis' appreciation.

After an opportunity for public comment, Ms. Hunsaker (Alert-O-Lite Inc.) motioned and Ms. Mathis (Clovis) seconded to approve as presented. The motion passed.

B. Draft Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement and Surface Transportation Block Grant Program Guidelines (Braden Duran) [ACTION]

Summary: In June 2021, as part of its routine federal and state certification process, FHWA and FTA issued Fresno COG a corrective action to remove suballocations of the Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) and Surface Transportation Block Grant (STBG) programs from its project programming and selection procedures. A similar corrective action was issued for the Caltrans Federal Statewide Transportation Improvement Program in accordance with 23 CFR 450.324(j).

Historically, Fresno COG split the CMAQ and STBG distributions into two programs. The regional competitive bid program was based on scoring criteria developed by a programming subcommittee, evaluated by a scoring committee, and approved by the Fresno COG Policy Board.

The Targeted Performance Program (TPP) -- formerly known as Lifeline -- was directly suballocated to member agencies based on population. TPP funds have been used at an agency's discretion; however, TPP projects are also based on criteria developed by a programming subcommittee and then evaluated by Fresno COG Staff to ensure they adhere to regional program guidelines and meet regional performance planning goals.

Under the corrective action, Fresno COG is mandated to remove the suballocation procedure from the CMAQ and STBG guidelines by Oct. 1. Accordingly, staff convened the Fresno COG Programming Subcommittee from January through May to review, develop, and approve new guidelines for both programs. Additionally, staff developed a project delivery policies and procedures document to streamline obligational activities and strengthen coordination across agencies. The Programming Subcommittee approved all three documents, which are included in the agenda packet.

The updated CMAQ guidelines also reflect funding distribution changes the Programming Subcommittee prefers. This new policy directs staff to allocate at least 95% of CMAQ apportionment to fund the regional bid competitive program, with the remainder to be reserved for: projects on the contingency list, post-programming adjustment requests, EPSP requests, or for retainment for future programming cycles.

Additionally, the CMAQ guidelines reflect changes to the scoring process and funding distribution within the regional bid program. Specifically, the Programming Subcommittee and staff are recommending new project category targets as a way to ensure a diverse set of projects is funded each cycle. Staff's proposed targets are indicated in the guidelines but may be subject to change (more on that below).

The updated STBG guidelines also reflect the subcommittee's changes to funding distribution, calling for staff to allocate at least 85% of STBG apportionment to fund the regional bid competitive program, with the remaining apportionment to be reserved for: post-programming adjustments, EPSP requests, pavement management system (PMS) updates, current contingency list projects, or for future programming cycles.

Fresno COG will manage the remaining apportionment of both programs based on fiscal year project delivery to ensure funds are obligated in a timely manner, and will follow Fresno COG's proposed Project Delivery Policies and Procedures.

Staff notes that guideline updates reflect only the changes needed to specifically address the corrective action. Topics such as: scoring rubrics, applications, STBG scoring process, CMAQ category targets, and others, will be discussed during the normally scheduled CMAQ and STBG call-for-projects cycle, scheduled for summer 2023.

If approved, Fresno COG will circulate the updated guidelines and resolution to Caltrans and FHWA to resolve the corrective action. Staff also notes that Caltrans and FHWA have been patiently and continuously involved in the guidelines update process.

Action: The Programming Subcommittee and staff request the TTC/PAC recommend the Policy Board approve Resolution 2022-27 adopting the updated CMAQ and STBG guidelines.

Comments: None

After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Mozier (Fresno City) motioned and Ms. Morales (Reedley) seconded to approve. The motion passed.

C. FY 2022-2023 Unmet Transit Needs Assessment Findings Report (Todd Sobrado) [ACTION]

Summary: Under California's Transportation Development Act, Fresno COG's Policy Board must determine that public transportation needs within Fresno County will be reasonably met in fiscal year 2022-23 before approving Local Transportation Fund claims for streets and roads. Fresno COG's Social Service Transportation Advisory Council (SSTAC) is responsible for evaluating unmet transit needs.

Each year the SSTAC begins soliciting comments by sending approximately 400 letters to agencies and individuals interested in providing feedback on their public transportation needs within Fresno County. The request for comments letters, in English and Spanish, was sent in January.

Public outreach was a combination of in-person and virtual events. In-person outreach consisted of six public events and a public hearing. Four of the six in-person events were held in the Fresno-Clovis Metropolitan area, while two were held in rural Fresno County. Based on feedback received in the last cycle of the UTN, one of the meetings within the Fresno-Clovis Metropolitan area was held on a Saturday to allow participation by those who were not able to participate in outreach events held during the week.

Virtual events consisted of three Zoom meetings, one of which was broadcast on the Fresno COG Facebook page, and an online survey. The three Zoom meetings took place throughout the day on Thurs., Feb. 17.

The second component of public outreach was an online survey available in both English and Spanish throughout February and March 2022. Staff received 12 comments, all through the online survey. A summary of the comments includes:

- Requests for transit service to Clovis Community College.
- Comments about service between outlying rural communities and the Fresno metropolitan area.

Public outreach for the current Unmet Transit Needs Assessment concluded with the public hearing that took place at the Fresno COG Policy Board on April 28. No comments were received.

After a thorough review of all comments and issues, the Social Services Transportation Advisory Council (SSTAC), at its April 14, meeting, found that of the 12 comments received, four were found to be unmet needs, none of which were deemed "reasonable to meet."

Action: Staff and SSTAC request the TTC/PAC recommend that the Board adopt Resolution 2022-26, approving Fresno COG's 2022-23 Unmet Need Assessment and to find that there are four unmet transit needs, none of which are "reasonable to meet."

Public Comment:

Lilia Becerril – commented that the report does not address many of the transportation deficit needs in Fresno. The roads are in bad condition and need to be repaired.

After an opportunity for public comment, Ms. Morales (Reedley) motioned and Ms. Hunsaker (Alert-O-Lite Inc.) seconded to approve. The motion passed.

D. Measure C Renewal Update (Tony Boren) [ACTION]

Summary: As has been discussed with the TTC/PAC and Fresno COG Policy Board, since late 2019, Fresno COG and Fresno County Transportation Authority staff in collaboration with a team of professional consultants (VRPA Technologies/Jeffrey Scott and Associates, Props and Measures) have been engaged in a vigorous regional planning process to develop a Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan for Fresno County voter's consideration in 2022. While our current Measure C (1/2 cent sales tax for transportation purposes) does not expire until July 1, 2027, there has been strong recognition at the staff and policy levels that there would be some significant advantages to seeking an early reauthorization of Measure C prior to its termination. Fresno COG staff will be giving a detailed PowerPoint presentation on the Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan and the process to produce that plan. Consequently, this annotated staff report will briefly highlight some of the major considerations/benefits/planning processes used to develop the new Expenditure Plan. The complete Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan and the related PowerPoint presentation can be found on Fresno COG's Measure C Renewal webpage at this link: [Measure C Renewal Plan Development Process - Fresno Council of Governments \(fresnocog.org\)](https://www.fresnocog.org/Measure-C-Renewal-Plan-Development-Process). The expenditure plan will be available after June 6th.

Following the Fresno COG Policy Board's action, the FCTA will be asked to consider and approve the Expenditure Plan at its July 20th meeting. Following FCTA Board approval, the plan will be presented to the Fresno County Board of Supervisors for approval and inclusion on the November 2022 ballot.

Measure C Renewal "Regional" Planning Process

- Fresno County region- 6,000 sq. miles/6,637 road miles
- Current population-1,023,358

15 Incorporated Cities

- Fresno - Population-546,770-53.26%
- Clovis - Population- 121,834-11.87%

13 Small Rural Incorporated Cities

- Population range -4,145-23,000
- Seven eastside cities-population 11.97%
- Six westside cities-population 6.32%

Fresno County-Unincorporated

- Population-170,067
- Population % -16.56
- Unincorporated communities within incorporated cities-Fig Garden/Sunnyside/Mayfair/Tarpey,
- Thirty-four "disadvantaged" unincorporated communities:
 - Eastside-Del Rey, Tombstone, Calwa, Malaga,
 - Westside-Easton, Caruthers, Raisin City Bowles, Cantura Creek, Lanare, Tranquility, West Park

The Measure C renewal planning process consisted of a two-prong strategy led by two committees with different membership compositions and responsibilities:

Technical Working Group (TWG)

Responsibilities:

- Identify funding needs, available funding, and funding gaps by mode
- Help develop preliminary recommendations to the Executive Committee

- Forward draft TWG products to Executive Committee for review and feedback
 - Provide information and feedback to other related stakeholders
- Project identification, prioritization and recommendations

Executive Committee (EC)

Responsibilities:

- Understand current & future transportation needs
- Review surveys and develop funding recommendations
- Provide Information & feedback to other related stakeholders/community leaders
- Assist with preparing the draft & final Measure C extension Expenditure Plan that best meets mobility needs and will have voter support

The Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan was developed following a set of five “guiding principles” adopted by both the TWG and the EC. These specific principles were:

1. Stewardship
2. Flexibility
3. Air quality and climate resiliency
4. Equity
5. Sustainability & resource conservation

In addition, there are several significant themes in this Expenditure Plan including “Fix it First”, “No Neighborhood Left Behind”, “Improve Transportation Safety”, and “Promises Made, Promises Kept.” For over 35 years Measure C has kept its promises of delivering high priority transportation improvements and services throughout Fresno County. Staff believes that this track record has led to the exceptionally high level of voter support reflected in the two surveys conducted to date.

Public Engagement Strategies

- Fourteen community meetings
- Door-to-door; 1,070 Spanish responses
 - Cantua Creek, Lanare, Tranquility, Orange Cove, Parlier, Kerman, Caruthers, Biola, Hmong community, Coalinga, Del Rey, Five Points, Huron, Sanger, Kingsburg, San Joaquin, Punjabi community
 - Community events
 - Virtual meetings
 - Online & in-person surveys: 2,800 surveys, 2,000 comments
 - Two public opinion surveys - statistically valid surveys - just short of 5,500 responses

FCTA/Fresno COG staff believe the Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan balances the inherently varied transportation interests of different stakeholders and represents the necessary regional consensus to garner support from two-thirds (66.7%) of Fresno County voters in 2022.

“Why now in 2022? “Why not wait until 2024?”

There are several reasons that proceeding in 2022 makes sense. These include:

- Recent surveying shows incredibly high voter support for a Measure C renewal.
 - Voter support for Measure C renewal is at 80% countywide.
 - Even when presented with negative arguments, voter support remains well in the 70% range.
 - Surveying demonstrates that voter opposition - “definitely no” is very low at about 10%. Statewide surveying average generally runs about 20%.
 - Due to ever shifting political winds, there is no guarantee that same support would be present in 2024 or beyond.
 - Voter approval in 2022 would allow the FCTA and local agencies to borrow or bond against future revenues generated to begin street/road pavement needs now
 - The sooner the necessary street/road repairs and associated transportation projects identified in the Measure C renewal plan can begin, the lower the cost will be. This is particularly true in times of high inflation. Obtaining voter approval in 2022 will allow the benefits to be experienced by the public much sooner.
 - Waiting another two years is not likely to change residents’ perception of their transportation needs.

- The proposed Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan is well considered and reflects the views of transportation professionals at both the regional and local levels, as well as the 15 cities, the County of Fresno and the general public.
- The Expenditure Plan reflects substantial public and private sector input..
- The Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan is targeted toward Fresno County voters’ highest transportation needs and includes significant local control with maximum flexibility at the local level.
- The apparent goal of those opposed to a 2022 ballot measure is to shift elected officials’ decision-making authority away to non-elected community-based organizations (CBOs).
- The Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan is designed to give maximum local control to those elected officials chosen by voters in their community
Voters’ transportation priorities are immediate needs. We owe it Fresno County residents to move forward now. Delaying voter consideration beyond 2022 makes no fiscal or policy sense.

Duration of Measure C Renewal - 30 years vs. 20 Years

- Revenue projections: 20-year - \$4 billion
30-year - \$6.8 billion
- Achieving a Countywide pavement condition index (PCI) of 70 would take nearly 90% of a 20-year MC3
- With a 30-year measure, a 70 PCI would take about 50% of the renewal funds
- A 30-year measure allows sufficient revenues to achieve a “good” PCI, defined as 70 out of 100, along with substantial funding for other important transportation facilities and services, including public transit and active transportation
- Surveying indicates that both durations -- 20-year or 30-year – enjoy widespread voter support: 80+%

Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan Highlights include:

- About \$6.84 billion in new revenue over 30 years for transportation improvements
- Slightly more than one-half of the revenue, \$3.5 billion, dedicated to **Local and Neighborhood Street Repair and Maintenance**. Fixing local streets has over 80% support in the two public surveys and is consistently the highest priority within all communities and areas of the County, cutting across all demographic and economic categories. It is also the top priority for nearly all the people who have attended public meetings and participated in on-line and in-person surveys. This level of funding is sufficient to raise the countywide average PCI to 70, which is within the good category. Further, the plan will require that each agency spend a minimum of 30% of their pavement repair funds in disadvantaged areas (as defined by CalEnviroScreen 4.0) until certain criteria is met; and an additional 5%, over and above the normal Measure C revenues will be allocated to very low-income areas.
- Over \$800 million will be dedicated to **Urban and Rural Public Transit**, more than double what transit will receive through the current measure. Keeping transit fares low for students, seniors, veterans, and the disabled also scored high in two surveys.
- Just under \$1 billion in the **Major Roads and Highways Safety Improvements and Congestion Relief Program** will focus on reducing and avoiding congestion, improving safety, and reducing greenhouse gases (GHG) and improving air quality. This funding is almost exclusively for modifications to the existing system, not for expansion. The Regional Program in the current measure used 30% of the overall funding, but in this measure, it is one half that amount at just under 15%.
- **Safe Bikes and Pedestrians** will receive approximately \$75 million, which may be the smallest program in the new measure; however, there are significant funding opportunities through non-Measure C sources resulting in well over 95% of the overall need in this category being met.
- \$144 million is dedicated to **Environmental Sustainability**, including: transit-oriented development, alternative fueling facilities, clean-air vehicles, and new technology projects. This program is a bit of a misnomer, as it implies that only these funds are being invested in these sustainability projects. In fact, environmental sustainability is built in to all of the other programs. This Environment Sustainability Program is over and above the funding in the other program categories.
- Lastly, \$1.2 billion is dedicated to the **Local Control Program**. Local Control allows each agency to address its highest priority transportation needs not specifically addressed in one of these categories; or, an agency can supplement any of the previously mentioned categories depending on where the highest need lies

Under this proposed Measure C3, administrative expenses have been reduced from 1.5% to 1.25%.

Besides the flexibility built into the Local Choice and other programs, this measure focuses on the first 15 years rather than trying to predict the 30-year need. This plan provides for a comprehensive review of the programs’ successes or

shortcomings near the measure's midpoint. That midpoint review will also re-evaluate the then-current needs and can make program or project adjustments at that time if the needs have changed.

"Local control" of Measure C funding is built into all of these programs. **Local and Neighborhood Street Repair and Maintenance, Urban and Rural Transit, Safe Bikes and Pedestrians**, and the **Local Choice Programs** are all under local control – each elected body will determine how and where those funds are invested. The **Major Roads and Highways Safety Improvement and Congestion Relief** project lists can be found on the Fresno COG renewal webpage linked above and were all developed with input from each of the 16 local agencies in Fresno County. **Environmental Sustainability** will be a competitive program with funding recommendations made by committees that will all contain public agency staff.

This plan also provides enhanced accountability measures. First, the Citizens Oversight Committee will be retained and enhanced. Second, each program category will have performance indicators to help the FCTA evaluate if the Measure C funds are being invested efficiently and effectively.

Similarly, the plan contains key principles to make sure that the transportation benefits provided by Measure C are shared equitably throughout Fresno County.

Tony Boren made a presentation to the committee regarding the Renewal Measure development process and Draft Expenditure Plan.

Committee comment:

Nick Paladino – Not comfortable approving when the public review extends to the 27th. Likes the plan but has an issue with timing.

Scott Mozier (City of Fresno) – Would like to state that it's been a good process thus far. He served as TWG co-chair. 22 meetings and an extensive process. This is a good plan.

Mohammad Khorsand (County of Fresno) – Moved to approve, Debbie Hunsaker seconded.

Public comment:

Grecia Elenes – Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability. TWG member. Very supportive of Measure C. Recognize the benefits of the Measure and all that it has done. Want a more transparent and inclusive public process. Listen to remarks.

Action: Fresno COG staff recommends the TTC/PAC approve the draft Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan as presented and move the Expenditure Plan forward to the Fresno COG Policy Board for its consideration.

After an opportunity for public comment, Mr. Khorsand (County of Fresno) motioned and Ms. Hunsaker (Alert-O-Lite Inc.) seconded to approve the draft Measure C Renewal Expenditure Plan as presented and move the Expenditure Plan forward to the Fresno COG Policy Board for its consideration.

Favor – All but Nick
Opposed – Nick Paladino
No abstentions.

Motion Passed.

III. OTHER ITEMS

A. Items from Staff

Starting June 13th, Denise Flores will be the new Office Administrator.

B. Items from Members

There were no items from members.

IV. PUBLIC PRESENTATIONS

A. Public Presentations

There were no public presentations.

V. JOINT TRANSPORTATION TECHNICAL/POLICY ADVISORY COMMITTEE

A. Caltrans Report (Caltrans) [INFORMATION]

None.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:42 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Tony Boren". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Tony Boren

Public:

Amalia CBDIO; Belinda McMillan Haener; Carolina Ilic; Chris Erwin; Christopher Xiong; Dario Dominguez; Esther Ramirez; Janelle Del Campo; Ken Wall; Leonardo Hernandez; Lilia Becerril; Maria Garcia; Michael Osborn; Philip Romero; Thomas Dulin; Grecia Elenes.

Staff:

Braden Duran; Todd Sobrado; Robert Phipps; Meg Prince; Kai Han; Kristine Cai; Suzanne Martinez; Santosh Bhattarai; Pankaj Joshi; Brenda Veenendaal.